Discipline and Happiness

The Case of The School of the Body, in Colombia

Candidate Number: 753562

Institute of Social and Cultural Anthropology

University of Oxford

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Philosophy in Social Anthropology

May 2012

Acknowledgements

This thesis is partly informed by my research with El Colegio del Cuerpo (The School of the Body), otherwise known as 'eCdC', in Cartagena de Indias, Colombia. I spent six weeks conducting fieldwork with this community in July and August 2011. I am extremely grateful to my friends here for so warmly welcoming me and for their part in helping to inform this research. Many at and associated with eCdC supported me in this study and while there are too many to name each of them in this note I wish to thank them all for their patience with my research and for sharing their stories and insights. I remain in awe of their achievements and ever inspired by their work.

I am particularly grateful to all the students, graduates, directors and teachers who taught me in classes and participated in interviews, including Álvaro Restrepo, Marie France Delieuvin, Eduard Martínez, Vivían Orozco, Frey González, Melissa Álvarez, Lobadys Pérez and Gunlodd Jona Runarsdottir. I am also enormously grateful to May Posse, eCdC's Academic Sub-Director, for all her thoughtful assistance.

Very special thanks go to Álvaro Restrepo and Marie France Delieuvin, Co-Founders and Co-Directors of El Colegio del Cuerpo, for so graciously and generously facilitating this unique opportunity for research. I am also grateful for their teaching. Additional thanks go to Kate Horne and HE Dr Jose Mauricio Rodríguez Múnera, Ambassador of Colombia to the UK, for first telling me about The School of the Body and putting me in touch with this extraordinary organisation.

It must be acknowledged that any conclusions expressed in this thesis are the interpretations of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of everybody at or associated with El Colegio del Cuerpo.

My thanks go to Dr Robert Parkin and Professor David Gellner for their part in approving this research. I am also grateful to Dr Caroline Potter and Dr Hélène Neveu Kringelbach who kindly advised me as to my fieldwork and research in the anthropology of dance and offered helpful comments on my written work. I would also like to thank Xenia Elsaesser for her brilliant extra help with interview transcriptions and translations.

I am especially grateful to Dr Elizabeth Ewart, for all her support and guidance throughout this project and for her continuous feedback on drafts of this thesis and the research that informed it.

Table of Contents

Introduction

'Perhaps I've insisted too much on the technology of domination and power. I am more and more interested in the interaction between oneself and others and in the technologies of individual domination, the history of how an individual acts upon himself, in the technology of the self.' - *Michel Foucault (1988: 19).*

'A teacher should be a wing maker. A teacher should make wings. And the rest is your work. It's your responsibility to fly.' – *Álvaro Restrepo, Co-Director of The School of the Body (2011).*

This thesis is a study in dance and education, with a particular focus as to how a body based education can inform understandings of discipline. This question shall be addressed in terms of discipline and embodiment. First I shall explore intellectual theories of social conditioning of individuals and their bodies, particularly as indicated by Foucault's work on social domination (1975) and Bourdieu's thinking on practice (1972). I shall then look to intellectual ideas about perception and learning through and from the body in studies by Merleau-Ponty (1945), Ingold (2000), Csordas (1994) Gibson (1966, 1979), Jackson (1983) and Farnell (1994). I consider these theories in social contexts of dance and education as presented in literature from the anthropology of dance and by my field site, the contemporary dance school, El Colegio del Cuerpo ('The School of the Body'), in Colombia, to which I shall refer by its acronym, eCdC.

Following my findings from the literature and my fieldwork, in this thesis the term discipline refers to discipline in a social sense as well as self-discipline. In the English language the term discipline can carry oppressive connotations, particularly in its use as a verb: to discipline, implying a control or training imposed. This seems particularly emphasised by Foucault's work (1975) on disciplinary institutions, in the nineteenth and twentieth century, including schools, controlling the 'docile bodies' of individuals in their midst. His study articulates a social imposition of discipline upon individuals by others in authoritative positions, according to their agendas. Illustrations of social training, whether implicit or explicit, in relation to individuals are also emphasised in the work of Bourdieu (1972) and Mauss (1934) amongst others and these point to the limited agency of individuals in their bodily action. Cartesian emphases on the mind

have also been critiqued for subjugating the body which seems interesting in terms of standard western education practices that tend to encourage individuals to keep their bodies still and seated in disciplinary settings such as school classrooms. While this may not often be forcibly imposed, it is usually required in standard schooling programs.

Meanwhile, of course, discipline may also be taken up by individuals themselves, as agents with their own agendas and various thinkers in anthropology and associated disciplines, including Foucault in his later work, turn increasingly to studies addressing agency and intent. Since the 1960's anthropologists such as Ingold (2000) Jackson (1983) and Farnell (1994) do so by building on studies of embodiment such as that of Merleau-Ponty (1945), in further attempt to integrate Cartesian divides.

These theoretical notions of discipline as they relate to the individual in bodily terms are particularly interesting when considered in studies of societies showing links between dance and education since these, like Foucault's schools, also present interpretations of discipline in relation to the body. However, unlike Foucault's studies, they often attend to the individual's perspective. Works from the anthropology of dance present not only themes such as socialisation (as social training), but also learning and re-learning through dance and social applications of dance education. These, like the theory reviewed, suggest both social discipline and agency in terms of self-discipline.

Thus in this thesis I consider discipline imposed upon individuals as well as discipline enacted by individuals, and, particularly following the case of the contemporary dance school, eCdC, discipline imparted between individuals. I shall call this third kind intersubjective discipline.

'With discipline and happiness you can achieve anything', a director told a class of seven year olds in the 'Education with Dance' program at eCdC. This prompted my interest in how a body based education like eCdC broached the notion of discipline in relation to the body, compared with Foucault's presentations of 'docile bodies' in schools.

eCdC's school is located in an old colonial house in the neighbourhood of Getsemaní,

in Cartagena de Indias, the capital city of Bolivar Department, on the Northwestern Caribbean coastline of Colombia. Here I spent six weeks conducting research from August to September 2011. Following the work of dance anthropologist, Drid Williams, I was keen to find out what individuals in a dance community such as eCdC were actually doing when they danced; what was the essential meaning of this activity for them (1991: 13, 21).

eCdC is an unusual contemporary dance school, as its training seeks to provide children not only with dance classes but also a particularly personal and social education. Here, individuals learn to learn with and from the whole body, not only alone but also interacting directly with others. In turn they develop personal and social values. This is illustrated particularly in eCdC's methodology: 'Education with Dance'. Considering this and Williams' prompt, I sought to learn what dance, and through it, discipline, meant to these individuals in their experience of a body based education. Beyond learning to dance, I was keen to discover how they were learning to learn and what were their understandings of discipline as members of this community.

I hoped to gain a sense of their understandings of discipline particularly in light of standard western schooling practice, Foucault's oppressive presentation of the body in disciplinary contexts and eCdC's political and social backdrop, including impositions of bodily abuse, in relation to which the school was created. In the context of Colombia's modern armed conflict and the bodily violence subsequently inflicted on many throughout the country in the past century, including massacres, killings, torture and countless displacements of persons (an estimated four million today), eCdC's active and collaborative whole-bodied approaches to discipline seem especially insightful.

I became particularly interested in eCdC's educational dimension for its disciplinary implications and the role of individuals in their own disciplinary transformations. I also wanted to see how closely the school's body based teaching philosophy, created by the founders and directors, matched the understandings of discipline of those training within it. I collected my data about body based teaching, learning and training through dance at eCdC, using several methods including interviews and filmed recordings. I

also participated in two dance classes with the dancers of eCdC's professional company, *Cuerpo de Indias* in Cartagena and in a workshop they conducted with children at a school in London since a bodily experience of eCdC seemed valuable for my research.

From my findings of self- and intersubjective disciplinary experiences in this setting I shall argue as to how these compare with suggestions of discipline in the studies of social domination, conditioning and embodiment reviewed; and in the dance anthropology.

My fieldwork findings as well as findings in the theory outlined relate to many of the studies in the literature on the anthropology of dance which also suggest strong connections to socialisation, learning and mastery or re-education in relation to the body.

In Chapter I, I look at intellectual theories of the body and its relationship to discipline focusing on treatments which address objectifications and neglects of agency, and seek to resolve Cartesian oppositions which tend to separate the body from the mind and the individual from society.

In Chapter II, I situate the school and its body based educational ethos, as illustrated particularly in its program, 'Education with Dance', in the context of eCdC's local and national setting and associated treatments of individuals and bodies. I also introduce my main informants at eCdC.

In Chapter III, I situate my research in light of the wider literature on the anthropology of dance, particularly considering studies which indicate links between dance and education. This chapter looks to works by Browning (1995), Potter (2008) and Hanna (1999), amongst others, which address these themes in ways which speak to my field findings. I compare notes on seeking a dance socialisation, integrating joyful and disciplinary aspects of dance and the use of dance to address, manage and in some cases master social realities. I argue that the literature suggests an increasing focus on agency to the extent that dance has been posited as a potential pedagogy (Hanna 1999), of significant value to society.

In Chapter IV, I present my findings as to how individuals in the case of The School of the Body understand discipline in their experience of this body based education, including self-discipline and intersubjective discipline. In particular, I explore the stories of my informants introduced in Chapter II. I also investigate applications of these understandings of discipline back into society. I argue as to how these kinds of discipline suggest attempts to bridge social tensions and to activate whole-bodied agency.

In Chapter V, I look to implications of my findings in this body based education in the context of the theory and literature reviewed and indicate further avenues of research.

I The Body: Discipline and Embodiment

In 1934, Marcel Mauss's essay 'Techniques of the Body' considered society's influence on the bodily practice of the individual, yet concerns about the objectification of the body and the individual were only chiefly emphasised and addressed in anthropology from the 1960's, contributing to an anthropology of the body. This new sub-discipline had strong links with another, forming shortly afterwards in the 1970's: an anthropology of the senses. It was also informed by studies on the body from sociology, philosophy and psychology including work by Mauss (1934), Bourdieu (1972), Merleau-Ponty (1945), Jackson (1983), Stoller (1989), Howes (2005), Gibson (1966, 1979), Ingold (2000) and Foucault (1975).

Postmodernists such as Michael Jackson claimed the body had been largely objectified; denied conscious agency and aim, treated instead as 'inert, passive and static' (1983: 329). As such it was all too often separated from and made secondary to the mind, society and the world. They called for alternatives to the proliferation of western, theoretical Cartesian dualisms, or opposing terms, which were at times applied to all societies as universal principles of social structures, in spite of some contrasting realities, and instead they sought more integrative formulations to better represent social realities, in local idioms.

This new era for anthropology shook up many early paradigms as various new schools and theories emerged, including new understandings of the body. Methodologies of embodiment sought to collapse oppositions such as subject:object, mind:body, world:body, practice:(social)structure. Two key embodiment studies of interest to anthropology were those of the philosopher Merleau-Ponty and the sociologist Bourdieu. The former explored 'perception' (Merleau-Ponty 2002 [1945]) and the latter addressed 'practice' (Bourdieu 1977 [1972], 1980 [1990]).

However, as critics would indicate, rather than integrating these terms by collapsing the divides between them, these studies sometimes seemed instead to shift the emphasis from one term to the other; still maintaining a hierarchic dynamic albeit with a changed prioritisation. Thus further integrations were sought. Some of these conceded

the body's indeterminacy and the ambiguity of the source of discipline over the individual's bodily actions.

Foucault's thinking over his career, likely influenced by Bourdieu, as well as his professor, Merleau-Ponty, spans the treatment of the individual and the body as both object and subject. While his major work on technologies of domination and social institutions which 'disciplined' the 'docile bodies' of individuals (1977 [1975]) poignantly addresses objectification, his later thinking turned more toward agency and subjectivity (1988: 18). Finally his interest looks to the disciplinary link between technologies of domination and technologies of the self (1988: 19).

Western tendencies to consider the body separately from the mind – as reflected in science and education following what Ingold calls 'the foundational assumptions of western thought and science' (2000: 170) – and indeed to objectivise it, treating it as separate and subordinate to the mind, were critiqued in anthropology for being 'Cartesian'. This was largely in response to Descartes' statement, 'Je pense donc je suis' (1637) or 'Cogito ergo sum' (1644) : 'I think therefore I am', to suggest existence is confirmed simply by thought.

Rationality is idealised in science but is also emphasised, albeit less explicitly, in regular education that promotes the intellect with limited reference to the body and its involvement in perceiving – 'an extension of knowing' as suggested by the psychologist James Gibson (1986 [1979]: 258). Physical activity in western schools is generally reserved for sport or gymnastic classes – if encouraged at all whereas in class, children are encouraged to keep their bodies still, as they learn by thinking with their minds. Such a physical situation seems somewhat to illustrate the distanced, unbiased objectivism idealised in western pedagogies.

Meanwhile, with the value set by unbiased objectivism in western philosophy, science and education, sight has likewise been prioritised as a sensory modality. This is suggested as far back as in the thinking of Plato and Aristotle, as well as, more recently, René Descartes, who called sight 'the noblest and most comprehensive of the senses' (1988 [1637]: 57).

Certainly conventional western educational approaches suggest that logic, literacy, vision and objectivism are still particularly highly valued and prioritised in learning settings. Senses such as touch and motion, meanwhile, seem less typically valued in western schools, in spite of how they might inform perception and knowing and may thus contribute to learning (Ingold 2000, Gibson 1986 [1979]). Such modes seem particularly interesting considered in body based educational settings, whose pedagogies emphasise interactive rather than purely didactic discipline.

David Howes considered the growing interest in the senses in both the humanities and the social sciences 'a sensual revolution' (2005: 1). Exploring various senses and how they related to one another, he and anthropologists including Classen (1993), Ingold (2000), Stoller (1989) and the psychologist James J. Gibson (1966, 1986 [1979]) questioned western tendencies to identify, separate and hierarchise what Geurts calls the 'classic five' senses (2002). Typically, these western treatments prioritised vision above other means of perception which many communities, beyond and within 'the west' did in fact value, sometimes more than or just as much as vision and other senses (2005: 9).

I. I Placing the body in anthropology

In 1934 Marcel Mauss attended seriously to the body in his essay 'Techniques of the Body', in which he outlined and attempted to contextualise various bodily practices. His 'techniques' centred on practices or special habits that were socially acquired. Mauss acknowledged the body as 'man's first and most natural technical object, and at the same time technical means' (1973 [1934]: 75) before addressing how its habits were socially acquired. It seems he was already attempting to address the body's subjectivity and objectivity some thirty years ahead of the debate in anthropology that sought to integrate these, especially in terms of embodiment.

Mauss's work seems particularly pertinent in the context of embodiment and power within the body politic as it implicates individuals and society. His writing on habitus bears a clear link to Bourdieu's articulation of habitus as bodily dispositions, also acquired from social contexts (see below).

Mauss used the Latin word 'habitus' to designate habits in which 'we should see the techniques and work of collective and individual practical reason' and which 'vary especially between societies, educations, proprieties and fashions, prestiges.' (1973 [1934]: 73) These included his famous techniques of the body: physical 'attitudes' which he argued were acquired by man, not only physiologically and psychologically but also sociologically or from imitating social conditions. He urged his readers that if they wanted to understand these facts in man, they must study him from a triple viewpoint, as 'total man'. However it is the sociological viewpoint or the influence of society over the individual's bodily techniques which is the emphasis of Mauss's essay.

Citing illustrations from various societies of comparative bodily techniques (including swimming, marching, walking from a more extensive repertoire from eating to giving birth) Mauss claimed: 'Each society has its own special habits' (1973 [1934]: 71). 'The action is imposed from without, from above, even if it is an exclusively biological action, involving his body.' (1973 [1934]: 73).

Like the work of Bourdieu and Foucault to come, Mauss's study indicates that bodily practices are somewhat determined by society, in turn limiting individuals, and their agency. Still, in describing the body as a 'means' as well as an object, Mauss's essay does seem to concede some ambiguity and an acknowledgement of some agency and subjectivity, albeit unelaborated; a concession which is perhaps less explicit in Bourdieu's work on social conditioning through the habitus.

I. II Divisions: body as separate and subjugated

Formerly in anthropology the body had largely been treated as a natural, biological or objective entity; usually the weaker side of not only the mind:body binary, but also culture:nature, social:biological, male:female. However with the deconstruction of such dualisms and the consequently reconstructed body, the hierarchy of these terms was questioned, as was the need to set them up in opposition rather than integrate them within a single site: the body. Jackson notes 'the denial of the somatic' to have been 'a persistent theme.' (1983: 328)

Moreover these uses and assumptions about the body were found to be inapplicable to bodies universally since they revealed a western bias in their Cartesian binary

articulations as well as the terms within the binaries which they claimed the body symbolised, such as nature as opposed to culture, mind or world.

Sensual hierarchies were also questioned and critiqued for western prioritisations of the visual over other sensory modalities often equally and sometimes more valued in many communities and cultures worldwide, in the experience and discourse of informants in both the West and in the East, such as hearing, speaking, motion and touch; as suggested by the work of Stoller (1989), Seeger (2004), Gibson (1966, 1979), Ingold (2000) and Hsu (2005).

Equally, thinking on cognitive processes was challenged; again emphasising western tendencies to value objective, scientific rationality rather than recognise that value in other or more integrative approaches, for instance contexts integrating feeling and action with thought as found by Stoller (1989: 5) or touch and motion in learning and specifically, moving, touching bodies in intersubjective disciplinary processes, as opposed to bodies left untouched and kept still.

Gibson highlights a western visual bias or 'ocularcentrism' (1966) and Ingold emphasises the western, Aristotelian tendency to emphasise and prioritise vision above other senses – perhaps in connection with other western scientific values such as rational, detached knowledge and objectivity. (2000: 245)

Foucault's attention to the 'gaze' of power in disciplinary institutions (1977 [1975]), emphasises the progression from 'disciplining bodies' by direct contact in physical torture to punishing and later 'regulating', normalising or socialising individuals through a more detached form of visual surveillance, in examples including Jeremy Bentham's *Panopticon* system. In this, a prisoner may always be seen by a person inside a central tower, although the prisoner may not see anyone there himself. He is 'the object of information, never a subject in communication.' (1977 [1975]: 200). Moreover, at times there may be nobody inside the tower but since the prisoner never knows, he must always assume that somebody is there. Thus effectively he monitors himself, as he internalises this imagined disciplinary gaze, according to the agenda of the prison, and in turn, society.

Meanwhile, in regular western schooling, vision (required for the highly prized skills of reading, writing and arithmetics) is still prioritised in classrooms as a sense or means of perception. By contrast, touch and motion are more often discouraged in class, if not disallowed. Similarly, the typical western education format tends to follow a disciplinary process of a teacher leading students rather than students also leading students or learning to respect and trust each other in assignments they undertake.

I: III Resolutions: body as integrated

Embodiment came about as one methodology attempting to collapse Cartesian dualisms. For Strathern and Stewart, it was once body theorising began to centre on embodiment that 'the body reached a new stage.' (2011: 388). Embodiment, as they articulate, is 'not the same' as the body but 'refers to patterns of behaviour inscribed on the body or enacted by people that find their expression in bodily form. It thus bridges over from the body as a source of perception into the realms of agency, practice, feeling, custom, the exercise of skills, performance and in the case of rituals, performativity' (2011: 389). Their articulations suggest that embodiment addresses the body in agency, movement and practice while the body in itself might have been treated more often as static, passive and theoretical as an academic entity.

Formulations of embodiment seeking more integrative perspectives on the body were articulated in Merleau-Ponty's problematic of perception (2002 [1945]) and Bourdieu's discourse on practice (1977 [1972], 1990 [1980]), the latter of which seems to have built upon Mauss's thinking on habitus. Csordas (1988) suggests that both theories of embodiment start with the body as a reference point from which culture could be understood. However both could be critiqued (as below) for their under-emphasis of agency.

Ortner describes 'practice' as 'neither a theory nor a method in itself' but 'a new key symbol of theoretical orientation'. (1984: 127). Amongst uses, the concept was employed by Bourdieu in his notion of habitus as a link between practice or action and social structures. This revealed the dominance of the latter in the scheme of things, reflecting power dynamics. Bourdieu's logic of practice also emphasises the role of the body and its practices within the social world, whose structure it maintains through its

actions. In his theory of practice, actors reproduce their social systems through a 'habitus' or set of dispositions, practices and actions, acquired from the social setting in which they grow up. This suggests practice or action is limited by social conditions.

Bourdieu's focus on dispositions begins with his formulation of 'habitus', which seems influenced particularly by that of Mauss and Aristotle**.** Aristotle's term 'hexis' referred to 'acquired ability' and 'faculty' (1973 [1934]: 73) and of course Mauss outlined the techniques of the body or special habits of the individual, conditional to each society (1973 [1934]: 71-2).

Bourdieu defines habitus in several ways, perhaps most notably: '… systems of durable, transposable dispositions, structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles which generate and organize practices and representations that can be objectively adapted to their outcomes without presupposing a conscious aiming at ends or an express mastery of the operations necessary to attain them.' (1990 [1980]: 53).

He suggests the habitus could be considered 'as a subjective but not individual system of internalised structures, schemes of perception, conception and action common to all members of the same group or class and constituting the precondition for all objectification and apperception..' (1977 [1972]: 86). It is: 'embodied history, internalized as a second nature and so forgotten as history… the active presence of the whole past of which it is the product.' (1990 [1980]: 56).

Habitus is particularly crucial in Bourdieu's social power equation, as the medium between individual practice and social structure; through which actors tend to reproduce the social structure. 'The habitus, the durably installed generative principle of regulated improvisations, produces practices which tend to reproduce the regularities immanent in the objective conditions of the production of their generative principle, while adjusting to the demands inscribed as objective potentialities in the situation, as defined by the cognitive and motivating structures making up the habitus.' (1977 [1972]: 78).

Foucault's work on the 'disciplined' body seems somewhat resonant with Bourdieu's on conditioned practice. To some extent he seemed to share with Bourdieu in a basic

understanding of power dynamics that typically maintained and reproduced the social status quo, keeping the dominant in power and the subordinated powerless. Bourdieu argued that the practice of actors tended to support the social structure through the habitus since this set of dispositions, actions and perceptions was acquired by imitating those in control. Meanwhile, for Foucault, social hierarchies were maintained in part through measures of discipline, which he called a technology of power. While they pursued different lines of focus in their work both Foucault and Bourdieu inferred that power dynamics maintaining social hierarchies were perpetuated and reproduced not only by those dominating society but also by those that they subordinated, in their internalisation of their disadvantage.

A self-designated 'Historian of Thought Systems', the sociologist and philosopher Michel Foucault made significant contributions to anthropology, especially in arenas of power, the body, feminism, the self and body politics; inspiring reflection and further work from anthropologists such as James C. Scott and Sherry B. Ortner. As well as by Bourdieu, his areas of expertise and interest were influenced by thinkers including Weber, Hegel, Heidegger, Sartre and Merleau-Ponty, while links can also be found to Durkheim.

Foucault is perhaps best known for his work on social power dynamics, from his famous study, *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of The Prison* (1977 [1975]), in which he articulates his understanding of the use or abuse of power in disciplinary institutions. He presents this in a largely negative tone in his descriptions of how society uses discipline as a technology of power to punish, correct, normalise or individualise people and regulate their behaviour (1977 [1975]).

In Foucault's articulation, illustrated by studies of events in several such institutions, including prisons, armies and schools, bodies were disciplined by society in a vivid array of methods, from public executions in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries to modern surveillance measures set up to maintain social hegemony (1977 [1975]).

While Foucault and Bourdieu tend to emphasise society's objectification of the individual and his body and its power over his practice, Merleau-Ponty (2002 [1945]) suggests a more subjective interpretation of the individual in society – and the world -

by articulating the body's 'pre-objectivity' (2002 [1945]: 281) and the individual's inherent bias in his unique experience.

In turn, if consciousness is not separate from the world, it cannot be objective (until a person learns to reflect). 'As I contemplate the blue of the sky I am not *set over against* it as an acosmic subject; I do not possess it in thought, or spread out towards it some idea of blue such as might reveal the secret of it, I abandon myself to it and plunge into this mystery, it 'thinks itself within me', I am the sky itself as it is drawn together and unified, and as it begins to exist for itself; my consciousness is saturated with this limitless blue.' (2002 [1945]: 249).

Merleau-Ponty addresses the subject:object dualism by emphasising the inherent bias of the individual subject, who can only contemplate from his own perspective. He refutes rationalist, scientific and intellectualist claims that value objectivity, arguing that a person's primary perception is 'pre-objective' and 'pre-conscious' (2002 [1945]: 281), whereas he learns to reflect upon himself objectively only later.

He also suggests a mind:body bridge. As against Descartes' rationalist or intellectualist 'Cogito ergo sum' (1644), explaining existence by way of thought, Merleau-Ponty emphasises an empiricist view, which accentuates the sense experience of the individual – his perception, which precedes conception. 'Consciousness is in the first place not a matter of "I think that" but of "I can."' (2002 [1945]: 124,137). This suggests that existence could be better explained as being and moreover, becoming, in the world, for the potential already inherent in experience, ahead of any objective reflection. After all, in Merleau-Ponty's view, the human is not born reflecting but comes to reflect and his perception is without limit. As Ingold suggests, considering his work: 'There is no limit to what can be perceived.' (2000: 166).

In turn, Merleau-Ponty seems to tackle the world:body dualism by presenting the human as attached to all else it perceives – including other persons, beings and objects, as all are part of the flesh of the world. 'Our own body is in the world as the heart is in the organism: it keeps the visible spectacle constantly alive, it breathes life into it and sustains it inwardly, and with it forms a system.' (2002 [1945]: 235) Indeed, the world is not a detached, objective entity but the subjective experience of each individual. The

world is not a universal experience as such but rather, the world as it appears to each person who is part of it, although he, and others, may share in some experience of existing.

Csordas (1990 [1988]) points out that while these attempts by Bourdieu and Merleau-Ponty to bridge Cartesian dualisms concerning the body were very different, they can both be associated within a paradigm of embodiment. To some extent they re-formulated power dynamics, although they both had their limitations.

I: IV Limitations

While these studies emphasised the body and its practice and attempted to integrate thinking concerning the body, critics including Ingold (2000: 170) pointed out that often, rather than resolve their terms of dualisms, embodiment theories instead seemed to emphasise one term above the other, thus retaining oppositions and leaving the problem of separation, dualism or hegemony unsolved. 'In effect, the dichotomy remains as strong as it always was; only the body has been repositioned. Formerly placed with the organism on the side of biology, the body has now reappeared as a "subject" on the side of culture. Far from collapsing the Cartesian dualism of subject and object, this move actually serves to reproduce it.' (2000: 170).

Most notably, biological determinism was seen to be replaced by sociological determinism (Turner 1984, Blackman 2008). Thus, the problematic became still more complex as the challenge turned from reconsidering the dominance of terms to actually breaking out of the thinking of dominance, hierarchy and opposition typical to western thinking in general and structuralism in anthropology.

Studies of embodiment such as those of Bourdieu and Merleau-Ponty were critiqued for failing to abolish binary dualisms as they could still be seen to some extent to over-emphasise one term; Merleau-Ponty perhaps over-subjectivising the individual while Bourdieu over-objectivised him. Merleau-Ponty's subjectivist living experience of the individual and body perhaps paid insufficient attention to his intent as a mark of agency (Farnell 1994: 934), while Bourdieu's objectivising society conditioned the individual's bodily practice, also limiting his agency (Strathern 1996: 28).

Although Bourdieu's work on habitus has been remarkable within anthropology and the turn to practice, in fact, the gap between structure and agency could be seen to be rather more blocked than mediated by habitus. Since the actions of his individuals tend to reproduce social structures it seems these categories are hardly collapsed. Rather, the hegemony of the social structure over the individual seems reiterated, underplaying his agency. As Strathern notes: 'In general.. Bourdieu's approach appears to render moot the question of agency and consciousness.' (1996: 28) Indeed Bourdieu's work can be seen to lean toward the 'tendency' for social structures to impact and thus dominate the actions of individuals, whereas, a true collapse of a practice:(social)structure dualism would at least invite more potential for the chance of individuals to impact social structures.

Ortner claims that the effects of the equation can really be read in two ways: 'how social systems impact the actions of individuals (and at an extreme, determine these) and how the actions of individuals impact social systems.' While the former 'notion of individuals trapped in social conditioning is more common', 'as of the 1980's interest is increasing in studying practice from an actor-oriented system.' (1984: 127).

Reay also calls attention to the dual nature of the habitus through which actors may potentially impact the structure with their practices even if the structure tends more often to impact these. Unlike Bourdieu, she emphasises at once the habitus' 'permeability' and 'ability to capture continuity and change'. (2004: 1).

In place of inverting dualisms and thus failing to escape them, Blackman instead also called for a focus on transformation and process, with the 'body as process that is continually in the making.' (2008: 109).

Meanwhile, although Foucault's major work shone a critical light on negative, objectivising treatments of the body and the individual through 'technologies of power' including torture, discipline and surveillance it could be argued that his emphasis in such work served to some extent to reiterate such objectification in his lack of attention, by contrast, to the individual's agency. In turn it may have encouraged negative interpretations of the word 'discipline' today.

Bryan Turner suggests that Foucault's discourse obscures the role of human agency and that such discourse (also analogous to discipline in this sense) shares difficulties with structuralist analysis of discourse, as it reduces the actor to an imitator performing only in accordance with determined rules (2008: 149). 'Some forms of discourse analysis reduce the individual agent/speaker to the level of a socialized parrot, which must speak/perform in a determinate manner in accordance with the rules of language.' (ibid.). In place of such automatic acceptance of orders from higher social powers, Turner suggests Foucault's work under-emphasises the reality of and potential for resistance. '…there is always resistance to discourse – an argument which Foucault recognizes but frequently forgets.' (2008: 150).

Terence Turner criticises Foucault's 'essential message of the futility of political action and the impossibility of meaningful emancipation from politically imposed controls.' (1994: 40). He goes on to emphasise his 'gratuitously inadequate and one-sided conceptualizations of his major theoretical categories: power, discourse, and the body itself.' (1994: 41).

Lisa Blackman also highlights in Foucault's major works a lack of agency, affectivity and vitality attributed to the body, pointing out: 'the body is not simply inert mass but has vitality.' (2008: 134)

Alternate ways of conceptualising power discourse and the body might look more toward agency in terms of motivation, the individual's attempt to consider and build on his own socialisation or to select other kinds of socialisation into further societies or communities and the individual's own placement of himself or his body in education, treatment of himself or his body in discipline and experience of self-discipline, taken up willingly, towards his own ends— as Foucault himself indicates in his later work.

I: V Further integrations: the lived experience of moving bodies

To some extent all these thinkers grant the ambiguity of the body's place in social power dynamics, and in relation to the mind and world. Bourdieu's formulation of the habitus and the social conditioning it mediates upon the individual is after all a tendency rather than a fact. Meanwhile Merleau-Ponty concedes that his own analysis is 'still abstract, for we exist in both ways *at once.* There is therefore, never determinism

and never absolute choice, I am never a thing and never bare consciousness.' (1958: 527).

In response to critiques of its determinant nature, Bourdieu suggests that his thinking on habitus be best seen as a method rather than a practice and that the habitus is best understood as a medium between actor and structure, which may mediate transformation, even as it tends to mediate social reproduction. (1990 [1982]: 116) Systems *tend* to reproduce themselves in such a way as to preserve their structures but such eventualities are not in fact determined. Thus, albeit unusual, subordinated individuals could act to transform themselves and their conditions and perhaps to some extent, the system. (ibid.) Still, these exceptions to the norm do not seem much discussed in his work on practice.

Perhaps following the limitations noted in these critiques, further integrations of embodiment emerged, exploring the ambiguity and indeterminacy of the body and bodily actions rather than attempting to reverse (still reductive) determinisms. As Csordas points out: 'the essential characteristic of embodiment is indeterminacy' and 'embodiment is reducible neither to representations of the body, to the body as an objectification of power, to the body as a physical entity or biological organism, nor to the body as an inalienable centre of individual consciousness.' (1994: xi). This notion was supported by thinkers such as Jackson (1983: 338).

Jackson (1983), Farnell (1994), Ingold (2000) and Gibson (1986 [1979]) seem to draw from Merleau-Ponty but suggest perhaps subtler notions of embodiment in their articulations; paying particular attention to agency as they integrate subject and object, body and mind, body and world.

Ingold and Gibson build on Merleau-Ponty's thinking to study the body as an existential ground from which all else is perceived. Ingold emphasises the body's 'dwelling-in-the-world' (2000) and Gibson writes, 'The environment of animals and men is what they perceive.' (1986: 15). Both then elaborate on the potential ('I can') which Merleau-Ponty emphasised in the individual's existence (2002 [1945]: 124,137) by exploring his agency, even in perception.

Ingold suggests that the body actually plays its own active part in cognition; both receiving and responding to information (critiquing cognitive science for Cartesian ontologies ensuring the body 'continues to be regarded as nothing more than an input device whose role is to receive information to be 'processed' by the mind') (2000: 165). Building on Gibson's 'ecological psychology', Ingold asks that the perceiving organism be treated 'not as a passive recipient of stimuli but as an agent who purposively seeks out information that would specify the meaningful properties of his or her environment (ibid.), perhaps integrating the body's subjectivity and objectivity more emphatically than Bourdieu.

Gibson suggests motion is key to perception (1986: 258) and that perception is key to 'information pick-up' (1986: 224) from an individual's surroundings. He explains this idea by showing how, while vision may be valuable for motion, motion is also crucial to vision, challenging typical western sense hierarchies. After all, looking at is more limiting than looking around and to look around an individual must move his body, at the very least, his neck to turn his head. (1986: 205). These links imply the value of motion for learning, an idea supported by findings from my case study, eCdC — in itself, a school which places the moving body at the centre of education (see Chapter IV).

Jackson also highlights bodily movement as key to experience, following on from Merleau-Ponty's work on experience. He reiterates Merleau-Ponty's notion of the body as an existential ground of culture but also draws from Bourdieu to assess practice as well as perception; thus attempting to integrate both notions of embodiment. He also takes Merleau-Ponty's notion of embodiment further, in order to 'avoid naïve subjectivism', by considering bodily praxis (1983: 330). In his articulation, Jackson implicates not just the body's lived experience but the *moving* body's lived experience - suggesting 'human experience is grounded in bodily movement within a social and material environment.' (ibid.). Likewise, Farnell (1994) emphasises the intent inherent in the experience of the living moving body (see Chapter IV).

Jackson notes a 'dearth of studies on the body-as-subject, of a phenomenology of embodied experience' (1983: 30) and seems to call for these in ways which integrate

both practice and perception; the practice of the subject, perhaps in a subtler integration of embodiment than the thinking of Merleau-Ponty or Bourdieu.

Other thinkers, such as Douglas (1970) and Lock and Scheper-Hughes (1987) presented further interpretations of 'the body' in the context of society, often showing how these overlapped. Douglas (1970: 65) drew attention to a double body – the physical and the social body. Meanwhile, Lock and Scheper-Hughes, calling for 'the deconstruction of received concepts about the body', emphasise three bodies or three perspectives 'from which the body may be viewed.' (1987: 6). These are: the individual body, the social body and the body politic (ibid.). For Lock and Scheper-Hughes, the individual body refers to a phenomenally experienced individual body-self; the social body is 'a natural symbol for thinking about relationships among nature, society and culture' and the body politic 'as an artifact of political or social control' refers to the regulation of bodies by society, through measures such as discipline (1987: 8), as explored by thinkers such as Bourdieu, and more explicitly, Foucault.

The body politic seems particularly pertinent of these three bodies, both to anthropology today and to this thesis as the most recent development of study on the body (in 'postmodernism'), and also the most integrative, as it takes in the other two perspectives of the individual and social body. These three perspectives are, as Scheper-Hughes and Lock clarify, 'separate and overlapping units of analysis.' (1987: 8)

'Of these the third body is the most dynamic in suggesting why and how certain kinds of bodies are socially produced' (1987: 8). Since the body politic also takes in 'individual' bodies, it seems this study yields an excellent opportunity to consider the agency of the individual and the body in such a social production of bodies.

Foucault also grants overlaps and ambiguities, as his later thinking shows. Agency certainly seems neglected in his early work on discipline and power, yet in his work on the self, agency seems key. Indeed, the trajectory of Foucault's thinking at different stages of his career can be seen to bridge what might seem two studies of embodiment with disparate implications: Bourdieu's emphasis of the objectivising hold of society over the individual and his actions (1977 [1972]); and Merleau-Ponty's elaboration of the pre-objectivity of the subject as part of the flesh of the world (2002 [1945]).

In *Discipline and Punish* (1977 [1975]) Foucault perhaps starts to turn towards this focus on agency and subjectivity, albeit ironically at that stage, as he calls for productions of power to be considered in a positive rather than negative light. 'We must cease once and for all to describe the effects of power in negative terms: it 'excludes', it 'represses', it 'censors', it 'abstracts', it 'masks', it 'conceals'. In fact, power produces; it produces reality; it produces domains of objects and rituals of truth.' (1977 [1975]: 194).

Certainly these early calls for positive interpretations of power and its 'production' can be read as a sinister exposition of state disciplinary measures, masquerading to be of benefit to the individuals they seek to discipline so as to be internalised by them.

Nonetheless, in such calls Foucault does seem to plant a seed for a different, perhaps more ambiguous slant on power that, once better understood for its complexity, could yield more for the individual within its midst. His later thinking reflects this, in various interviews and particularly in his Vermont seminars on 'Technologies of the Self'. This was a topic he was said to be investigating in preparation for a book, 'a genealogy of how the self (constitutes) *itself* as subject', shortly before he died in 1984 (1988: 3, 4).

In these seminars, Foucault outlines several different ways in culture that humans develop knowledge about themselves. Amongst four major types of these technologies he outlines two which seem contradictory. Technologies of power 'determine the conduct of individuals and submit them to certain ends or domination, an objectivizing of the subject' (1988: 18). Meanwhile, technologies of the self 'permit individuals to effect by their own means or with the help of others a certain number of operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being, so as to transform themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection or immortality.' (ibid.)

The critiques of Foucault outlined above refer to his earlier works. Still, it is interesting that since these critiques were published after his seminar 'Technologies of the Self' (1998) they do not include the increasing attention to the individual's agency which is evident in his later thought. This thinking on embodiment and agency may well have been influenced by his professor, Merleau-Ponty.

It appears that Foucault transforms his focus, if not his views, about power throughout his career, just as he traces the transformations of power technologies in societies over time. Since transformation seems crucial throughout his work, it seems fitting to view it through a lens of transformation and consider the individual's power in his own disciplinary transformation.

Foucault's call can be taken further by finding links in his own studies which show other understandings of discipline, more positive readings and interpretations, than are commonly acknowledged, perhaps partly due to his earlier works. In interviews published in 1980 he claims: 'It seems to me that power is "always already there", that one is never "outside" it, that there are no "margins" for those who break with the system to gambol in. But this does not entail the necessity of accepting an inescapable form of domination or an absolute privilege on the side of the law. To say that one can never be "outside" power does not mean that one is trapped and condemned to defeat no matter what.' (1980: 142).

In this vein, in his words on 'Technologies of the Self', Foucault reconsiders his earlier views in response to their common interpretations of negativity:

'...it seems to me now that the notion of social repression is quite inadequate for capturing what is precisely the productive aspect of social power. In defining the effects of power as repression, one adopts a purely juridical conception of such power, one identifies power with a law which says no, power is taken above all as carrying the force of a prohibition. Now I believe that this is a wholly negative, narrow, skeletal conception of power, one which has been curiously widespread.

If power were never anything but repressive, if it never did anything but to say no, do you really think one would be brought to obey it? What makes power hold good, what makes it accepted, is simply the fact that it doesn't only weigh on us as a force that says no, but that it traverses and produces things, it induces pleasure, forms knowledge, produces discourse. It needs to be considered as a productive network which runs through the whole social body, much more than as a negative instance whose function is repression.' (1988: 1).

Could less repressive understandings of discipline such as Foucault's later interest in 'governmentality' (1988, 1991) link these technologies of domination and the self (1988: 19)? In the first case discipline carries restraining connotations as it frames the individual as disciplined only to serve the powers that discipline him in society. In such a context he is controlled by society, to benefit society, perhaps at his own cost. In the second, discipline appears liberating, as the individual can transform himself, either alone or with others, for positive ends, that might benefit himself and perhaps also society. The first case pins the individual as an object of society. The second acknowledges him as a subject, and an agent in his own transformation.

Alternate approaches to discipline may also be discerned in communities of education based on the body, such as my case study - eCdC (see Chapters II and IV) - and various ethnographies in the anthropology of dance (see Chapter III) which address the body's agency.

II. *The School of the Body*

'When I arrived it was the artistic side that interested me, and still interests me. But the artistic side had this impact, and effect that I hadn't seen before, in my work in France, or in the United States. This interested me because it adds so much more value and inspiration.' – *Marie France Delieuvin, Co-Founder and Co-Director of eCdC*

II: I eCdC

eCdC was founded in 1997 as a project with three dimensions: artistic, social and educational. A non-profit organisation, with a contemporary dance school at its core, it specialises in a body based education through the medium of dance. eCdC's philosophy proposes an 'ethic of the body' which treats it as a subject as well as an individual's instrument (as elaborated in Chapter IV).

The school began by admitting marginalised youth from tough neighbourhoods on the outskirts of Cartagena. Initially, the majority of students such as those in its first year, the 'Pilot Experimental Group', came from shantytowns such as 'Nelson Mandela'. Considering their circumstances, these children and many others throughout the years were enrolled through government subsidies and foundation grants.

Today, while the majority of students still attend from challenging social backgrounds, since 2008 others have also joined from other social and regional sectors of Cartagena, Colombia and beyond (one girl, from Iceland) as the school opened its doors to a wider social representation in a further attempt at social integration. Accordingly, as of 2008, some pay either a full or a partial fee for their education, depending on their financial circumstances.

Indeed, while it supports those dedicated to its programs eCdC is not a charity - as is evident in the quality of its artistic dimension. eCdC's professional contemporary dance company, *La Compañía del Cuerpo de Indias* (to whom I shall refer as *Cuerpo de Indias*) has performed internationally to high acclaim and the school's artistic standards remain prestigious.

eCdC's educational dimension has also been revered both locally and internationally,

whether for dance training specifically or for its unique body based approach. Since 2001 eCdC's programs have been officially designated the categories of 'Education *with* Dance' and 'Education *for* Dance'. Although these overlap to some extent since the school's philosophy and 'ethic of the body' informs them both, each has a particular emphasis.

Education for Dance focuses on preparing students for careers in dance, if they choose to pursue these, including teaching dance and working in choreography as well as dancing itself. Graduates of classes in this program have gone on to some highly rewarding careers, as seen by the examples of the six professional dancers in *Cuerpo de Indias*. Choreography is an essential part of the construction of all works and the dancers are often as involved with selecting the music for their performances as they are in sculpting the movements that accompany it. Amongst their repertoire they have mastered choreographies to a range of musical scores, including stirring laments by Colombian folkloric singers such as Etelvina Maldonado and classical compositions by Handel, Bach and Chopin. These tend to be powerfully emotional in keeping with the themes explored (See Chapter IV) and consequently the sounds of recordings playing in classes infuse the school with a spirited atmosphere.

Classes within the Education with Dance program tend to include the youngest at eCdC, children from the age of seven years old, who still attend regular school. These sessions, often taught at weekends or after school hours, focus on introducing the school's body based philosophy to children through contemporary dance, to help them develop personal and social values by learning to learn from the body.

While the majority of weekly classes take place in programs in Education for Dance those in Education with Dance illustrate the school's social dimension in its considerable outreach to children in collaborative projects in Colombia and further afield. These have included exchanges and workshops in the USA, South Africa and the UK, such as a one-day program with *Skinners Academy* in London in March 2012 (see Chapter IV). The methodology was officially implemented for the first time in 2001 with two social projects. 'Integrated Services for Youngsters', sponsored by the World Bank, catered for 110 children from the south eastern zone of Cartagena, where

they experienced very poor living conditions. Meanwhile '*Project MA: My Body: My Home*' (see Chapter IV) included 110 children displaced by the war, living in the Nelson Mandela neighbourhood. This was sponsored by the Social Solidarity Net, in charge of the displaced population in the Colombia in that time. Due to the results of eCdC's 'Education with Dance' programs both at and outside the school, its methodology has been recognised as a pedagogic model in Colombia and also abroad.

The architectural layout of the school includes two dance studio spaces where the students have classes and offices for the directors and administrative staff, although other studio spaces can also be found elsewhere in the city, often in buildings donated by philanthropic foundations. Its architectural layout is comprised of two buildings, linked by an outside terracotta patio, bathed in the shade of a vast tree. The principal building is accessed from Calle Larga, a main street running through Cartagena. One enters into a small reception area, with a small triangular office to its right for the secretary and sound technician. Opposite that, the other side of a narrow passage is a main office for the directors and at the end of the passage, a further office for administration. To the immediate right of the corridor is a tiny room where a member of staff prepares coffee and iced teas, for thirsty dancers, served across a small wooden bar. The glass doors at the back of the director's office slide open to the patio, beyond which is the downstairs studio of the second building. Above this is the upstairs studio space, accessed by a metal stairwell, painted bright blue.

In the summer months in Cartagena, temperatures can reach up to forty degrees celsius daily. The body heat moving through these spaces, compounded with the heat outside, ensures, in spite of fans in every room and air conditioning in the downstairs studio, that everybody there, dancers, visitors or staff, is visibly sweating at all times of the day. The upper studio, wall-less on one side and as such without air conditioning but only fans, is filled with the natural heat of the outside air, lending it, with the sprung floor beneath, a sense of both levity and lull. It is a space also filled with light, as it welcomes the sun, unlike the dimmer space below, which seems cooler and more intimate.

II. II Setting

Cartagena de Indias has a colourful history, from its pre-colonial period to the present,

and still continues to transform at a remarkable rate, with dramatic social and architectural changes. Founded in 1533 for its strategic position on the tip of South America, and in the region of Nueva Granada, which then comprised what is now Colombia, Panama, Ecuador and Venezuela, it was a major trading port during the Spanish Empire for slaves brought from Africa and gold and silver from the Americas to Spain and on through Europe. As such it was constantly attacked by colonisers and treasure-seekers (including Sir Francis Drake) and was fortified for defense with a vast coral wall, 30ft high and at least 10ft thick, extending some 4km. This fortified area is known as the 'historic centre' or the old city. Filled with multicoloured houses, colossal cathedrals and clocktowers lining cobbled streets clipped with the sounds of horses hooves, this part of Cartagena inspired many tales by the writer Gabriel García Márquez. It buzzes with music and the constant chatter of people meeting in the streets and squares or on the walls, looking out onto the water.

Today the city stretches far beyond the fortification, sprawling with numerous and varied neighbourhoods, from its more affluent central areas with their skyscrapers and modern housing developments to the shantytowns on its ever-expanding periphery, illustrating a sharp economic and social disparity. Indeed many locals claim that Cartagena's walls symbolise these divisions, a reality perhaps less noted by international tourists, increasingly drawn to the charms of the old city. Tourism is now a major industry. *El Tiempo*, a major national newspaper, reports (2012) that some 200, 000 foreigners arrived in cruise ships to Cartagena in the single summer season from early October 2010 to early January 2011, with 10, 248 reaching the port in four ships on the first working day of 2011.

The 'historic centre' was designated a UNESCO Patrimony of Humanity in 1984. Thanks partly to this status and its consequent security many may have also felt safer here than in other parts of the country following Colombia's troubles with modern armed conflict between guerilla, paramilitary and government organisations over the past half century. While the notorious spate of brutality known as 'La Violencia' beginning in the 1940's and lasting for some eighteen years, leaving hundreds of thousands dead, injured or displaced, has been particularly reported, many have termed the continuing terrorism surging through the country in the years to follow as

'Colombia's undeclared civil war'. There are now some four million people thought to have been uprooted, with over three million already registered as IDP's (Internally Displaced Persons), according to The UN Refugee Agency UNHCR (2012) and Cartagena is amongst the cities receiving numerous influxes. However, in the past decade the armed conflict is said to have ebbed or changed (UNHCR 2010) dramatically after significant resolution and negotiation initiatives such as the demobilisation of armed organisations. In turn, in recent years tourism has soared nationwide, with Cartagena de Indias remaining one of the most popular tourist destinations in Colombia.

This interest is shared by a rush of investors from other parts of Colombia and countries beyond. Local owners of old houses in central neighbourhoods like the Centro Historico and Getsemaní increasingly sell their properties to immigrants, chiefly from Europe and Colombian cities such as Bogotá and move to new developments further out. Meanwhile those who had been living further out are pushed out further still, to the distant peripheries where many, often including those uprooted from other regions, find themselves in basic, quickly built shacks and poor living conditions. Indeed, while the seaside location, colourful Caribbean atmosphere, friendly people, striking architecture, relative safety and rich history of Cartagena attract tourists and investors, some 70% of Cartageneros live below the poverty line. Still, some locals feel there is now more dialogue across the city about these issues than they remember in earlier years, which they find encouraging.

II. III Community

ECdC has fourteen members of staff working at the school including its directors, the six professional dancers of *Cuerpo de Indias* who graduated from the school with teaching diplomas and are now teachers and program coordinators, and a number of administrative assistants. The wider corporation, extending beyond the physical school, includes board members, associates and partners. This year, 2012, some three hundred students flock through the school's doors every week to attend classes in its various programs.

eCdC was founded in 1997 by the Colombian-French professional partnership of

Álvaro Restrepo and Marie France Delieuvin who have since co-directed the school. Álvaro is a dancer, choreographer and pedagogue – and one of Colombia's pioneers of contemporary dance. His family comes from Cartagena. He studied piano, philosophy, literature and theatre in Bogotá, before training in contemporary dance in New York City with teachers including the world famous dancer and dance educator, Martha Graham. He danced professionally for fourteen years before deciding to return to Colombia; first to Bogotá, where he began to set up a social dance initiative, called *El Puente,* 'The Bridge' with the French choreographer, pedagogue and dancer Marie France Delieuvin. Marie France was director of The National Choreographic Centre for Contemporary Dance in Angers, France, when Álvaro invited her to come to Colombia for the first time.

At first *El Puente* functioned as an exchange program between dance students in Colombia and France, but soon the pair decided to develop an educational as well as social and artistic project. Feeling a need to help socially marginalised children through contemporary dance, starting in Cartagena, they continued the initiative here. Álvaro moved back to Cartagena and he and Marie France founded eCdC, to prepare those talented in dance for professional dance careers and to support all students in their development of personal and social values, through their body based pedagogy (see chapter IV).

Álvaro's own educational process was 'one of denial, repression and fear' for the violent physical treatment imposed on him by educators at his school. Outside school meanwhile, he grew up amidst more violence, at home and in the climate of the time. This education, negating or abusing the body, was a strong impetus for him to want to create a school with a very different bodily message (see chapter IV).

Now Álvaro works from eCdC year round while Marie France works in both France and Colombia. From France she supports eCdC's European collaborations for a small part of the year but mostly she is at eCdC, working directly with the dancers and students at the school in classes, workshops and choreographies for school programs, degrees and shows.

Other than these directors, my main informants at eCdC were students - some current,

some former – all with considerable experience of its body based education. Everybody at the school is enrolled in a program of one to two years and a number continue to the senior level. After graduating from their programs, some leave the community, while others join eCdC's staff, as program coordinators, teachers and choreographers, with a fixed salary. Some are admitted to *Cuerpo de Indias*.

Vivían and Eduard are graduates of the school. Since they joined they took various classes and programs, completed diplomas and are now licensed to teach dance which they do at eCdC, as well as coordinating programs or leading workshops with attending children and students. These two also have professional careers as dancers in *Cuerpo de Indias*.

Vivían, twenty-nine years old, from the neighbourhood of Torrices in Cartagena, decided to join eCdC to pursue a dance career in spite of university training for a career in finance. Her former dance experience was in Afro-Caribbean dance. She now lives in the Historic Centre of town and has traveled internationally for every show the company has performed. She first left Colombia with eCdC aged nineteen to dance in a show in Paris, France.

Eduard, aged twenty-five, joined eCdC's first Pilot year in 1997, aged eleven. Another of the leading dancers of the company, he had in fact anticipated a medical career as a child. It was only once he realised his natural ability and passion for dance upon discovering the school, deciding 'contemporary dance (was) made for him' and the level of contact he could have with others by being part of this community that he could not see himself doing anything else but fulfilling his vocation. He grew up in Almirante Colon and now lives in Getsemaní.

Twenty-two-year-old Frey joined eCdC when he was eleven and decided to dedicate himself to dance when he was fifteen. He grew up in the violent neighbourhood of Nelson Mandela on the outskirts of Cartagena, where crime was widespread. Outside his regular school hours he had been attending a youth police course as his mother wanted him to join the police. It was during this course that his attention turned to dance, since the group had a dance sub-project (see chapter IV). He now lives in Getsemaní.

Meanwhile Melissa, aged twenty, came to eCdC two years ago from Bogotá where she was studying for a degree in contemporary dance with ASAB, the Academy of Higher Art Education. She is one of the few students to have arrived from outside Cartagena, in the school's initiative as of 2008 to include young people from various locations.

I also heard the stories of some students who had left eCdC to set up their own creative social initiatives. Lobadys, aged thirty-three, joined eCdC in 1999 when he was eighteen and acted as 'big brother' to the others from the first Pilot class, who were all a little younger than him. He graduated from the school's top program and danced with *Cuerpo de Indias* for several years before deciding to move on to start a social youth forum based on dance (see chapter IV).

The current student body includes a multi-racial range of young people, from various social sectors, from the ages of seven up to twenty-nine years old. The gender split at eCdC is currently predominantly male; seventy per cent of participants are male and thirty per cent are female. As noted, some have joined from elsewhere in the last few years but most come from various parts of Cartagena, including districts such as Boca Grande and shantytowns on the periphery such as Nelson Mandela although since joining eCdC many have moved towards the centre of town. Members of *Cuerpo de Indias*, for instance, now live in some of the most coveted districts.

Students also range in build. While the name of the school and its proficiency as a dance academy might suggest otherwise, in fact the bodies of those here vary in shape, weight, height and fitness. There seem two key reasons for this. Firstly, contemporary dance itself, a dance form which developed from and in reaction to ballet, deliberately seeks not to conform to an ideal body type or homogenised performance aesthetics. Secondly, eCdC's education objectives are two-fold. The focus is not only on dance in itself but most importantly, as noted above, on actually learning from the body.

II: IV Focus on pedagogy: education with dance

For the purposes of this thesis I shall focus in particular on the methodology 'Education with Dance', for the insights this yields in terms of embodiment and the way in which understandings of discipline are expressed and developed through a body

based education (see Chapter IV).

Although the school's two program categories illustrate different emphases of education at eCdC, the humanistic, body based ethos emphasised in programs 'with dance' has been a crucial part of eCdC's pedagogy from the school's foundation. Of course, all students at eCdC experience a body based education with dance to some extent since dance is their principal activity throughout classes. Whether focused on teaching anatomy or dance routines for professional shows, all classes are taught with the ethos of this methodology and the illustration of the body, both in mobile, experiential practice and as a reference.

This methodology has been particularly revered worldwide for the way that it encourages individuals not only learn to learn from the body through dance, but also to apply this learning socially. While the ethic of the body 'as a sacred space' helps them build self-esteem and self-respect it also presents them with Álvaro's notion that the individual body and self is 'a metaphor of the collective, social and planetarian body'.

Members of *Cuerpo de Indias* like Eduard who joined eCdC in its founding year grew up with the school's philosophy now transmitted to those seeking 'Education with Dance'. Moreover, he and all the other professional dancers of the company, as teachers and program coordinators, use this methodology to teach children, both at the school and in the local and international exchanges noted. In these they emphasise the agency of the feeling, thinking, moving and interacting body.

III Bodily Education and the Anthropology of Dance

'...dancing, on the one hand, has been treated as dangerous through its association with the Dionysian and, on the other it has been elevated through its connection with the Apollonian.' – *Helen Thomas* (2003: 188).

III. I Dance in anthropology

The anthropology of dance is a relatively young field, becoming established as a sub-discipline in the mid-1970's when dance was increasingly treated as a social phenomenon. However, references to dance can be found in works dating from early on in anthropology. While many tended to treat dance as an aspect of wider topics such as ritual, Evans-Pritchard's 1928 essay, 'The Dance', expressed his fascination with this subject and called for further, detailed investigation into its social value and the motives of its practitioners. This was taken up particularly by dance anthropologists some fifty years later and today the field is growing fast.

In the past century, various dances have featured in anthropological studies, from all continents. Many works published before the 1980's feature dances that are traditional to local communities, such as Andamanese ceremonial dances in the Indian Ocean island archipelago (Radcliffe-Brown 1914), children's initiation dances amongst Samoan island peoples of the South Pacific Ocean (Mead 1928), the *gbere buda* mortuary ritual dancing of the Azande in the Anglo-Egyptian Sudan (Evans-Pritchard 1928), Kwakiutl dances in British Columbia, North America (Boas 1941) and Balinese trance dances in Indonesia (Mead and Bateson 1952).

Some dance ethnographies published since the 1980's continue in this trend – including studies of tango in Argentina (Savigliano and Castro in Washabaugh 1998), flamenco in Spain (Washabaugh 1998), rebetika in Greece (Holst-Warhaft in Washabaugh 1998), Indian Kathak dance in Calcutta (Chakravorty 2004) and Javanese court dance in south central Java (Hughes-Freeland 2008). Meanwhile, others take in several forms in one location, noting the popularity and practice of additional dances to those which governments promote as traditional, to illustrate national identity. In this vein, Wade (2000) considers Colombian music and dance 'from the coast' as well as forms in other regions of the country; Daniel (1995) explores various takes on rumba

in Cuba; Browning (1995) compares a variety of dances in Brazil from highly publicised carnival samba styles with forms less often accessed by foreigners like capoeira and Candomblé practices; Neveu Kringelbach (2005) looks at the interconnected forms of "women's dances", folkloric genre and innovative theatrical dance in Senegambia; and Wulff considers Riverdance and *sean nos* crossroads dancing in Ireland (2007).

Further recent works look to transglobal forms, some of which seek to integrate multiple cultural influences and are widely practiced. These forms include rave dancing (Thomas 2003) and contemporary dance, as shown through a growing literature taking in practices in North America (Bull 1997), Senegal (Neveu Kringelbach 2005), London (Potter 2008), Puerto Rico (Sloat 2010) and Palestine (Rowe 2010) amongst examples. It seems dance anthropologists have also been increasingly studying dances in urban settings, and in developed as well as developing nations (Novack 1990, Grau and Jordan 2000, Potter 2008).

Dance studies such as the above illuminate social themes such as ritual, gender, sexuality, power, nationalism, identity, globalisation, tourism, and healing (Friedson 1996; Hanna 2006). However, a further topic linked to many of these, although perhaps under-emphasised given its prevalence in dance anthropology, is education. It is this aspect that is particularly relevant to the present thesis.

III. II Dance and education

Dance and education have long been linked in social anthropology, as suggested especially by studies alluding to socialisation (as social training), learning and re-learning through dance and applying this body based education back into society. Earlier studies predominantly refer to dance as part of socialisation imposed by society while later studies, since the 1980's, tend to turn to learning taken up by individuals as agents. Where these recent studies consider socialisation through dance they seem to highlight the individual's experience of learning to manage it. Through dance, she might address the social status quo (Browning 1995), use dance to achieve her own desires such as social mobility (Neveu Kringelbach 2005: 17) or express a wider range of emotions than otherwise deemed morally appropriate in everyday life (Neveu Kringelbach 2008: 1).

Some dance ethnographies looking at learning from the individual's perspective focus on training processes themselves. There seems to be a growing attention to perception and the senses in dance learning contexts. This often highlights how an individual might question her early socialisation of learning in childhood to master other ways of learning and in turn, another kind of socialisation on choosing to enter a dance community.

In this, attention turns to bodily learning, bodily knowledge and embodied learning (Jackson 1983) in contrast to western emphases on learning, especially in standard education practices which seem to value a more disembodied intellect while often largely neglecting sensory modalities such as touch and movement or the use of multiple senses, as discussed in Chapter I.

In these studies which seek experiential analysis, in the experience of individuals in communities, dance anthropologists themselves have also, since the 1980's (as noted above) tended to participate in dancing in the field. These anthropologists, like many of those they study, can thus also often be understood to enter willingly into an education unfamiliar or in contrast with that of their childhood socialisation, acting as agents of their own re-education and socialisation into a dance community.

Increasingly also (as noted) dance studies in anthropology feature modern or integrative forms, such as contemporary dance. Aspects of this, such as contact improvisation seem to carry value not only for skills in dance and the studio, but also outside in society, and some anthropologists even indicate that dance training could be increasingly introduced in schools (Thomas 2003), if not considered as an education model in itself (Hanna 1999).

In many dance ethnographies there also seems to be some notice of both discipline and pleasure within dance practices and experiences. However, while some early works tend to emphasise one or the other (Radcliffe-Brown's 'enjoyment', Mead's enforced 'individuality'), more recent studies, perhaps following Evans-Pritchard's call for detailed attention to both structure and form in dance studies and both order and enjoyment in the Azande mortuary ritual dances (1928), seem to look more closely at their connection: how discipline and happiness can overlap. Thomas critiques what she

suggests have been two separations or extremes of these in the Dionysian and Apollonian views of dance, while Chakravorty experiences both rigour and elation in Indian Kathak dance (2004) and Neveu Kringelbach finds an inseparability of reason and emotion, as expressed in the sensual *sabar* dances of women in Senegal, even in social contexts that value emotional restraint for its 'higher moral status' (2008). Moreover, amongst others, Novack (1990, 1997), Thomas (2003: 111) and Potter (2008) note the term 'flow', comprising techniques of both 'contraction and release', as an ideal to be attained in contemporary dance.

It seems important thus to note two kinds of discipline suggested in these dance studies: that of the agent learning to dance, fusing various senses (motion, touch) and Cartesian dualisms (mind:body) in perception, and that of agents engaging with each other and society interactively in practice (individual:society; inner:outer). Some recent dance studies seem to consider the discipline both in training in dance communities and in applying it outside, in society: linking the discipline sought in embodied perception with that of embodied practice. Barbara Browning, for instance, shows how learning capoeira and Candomblé techniques in Brazil can be practiced with some agency in order to engage with others in society, albeit often ironically, by satirising social inequalities.

Finally, works presenting discipline to master both socialisation and learning recall attempts in the anthropology of the body to further theories of embodiment; for instance, linking Bourdieu's thinking on practice with Merleau-Ponty's on perception. In particular, ethnographies by Browning (1995) and Potter (2008) speak to my study, as I shall show in the following chapter.

III. III Dance and socialisation: society's perspective

Following early references to origins and definitions of dance in the evolutionist era of anthropology, for instance describing 'the dance' as 'an 'aesthetic impulse of "primitive" humanity' (Williams 2004: 54), the primitiveness of the dance suggested by Harrisson amongst others (Williams 2004: 71), functionalist studies turned to explanations of its use in society; often as an aspect of socialisation. These note functions of dance as social training from society's perspective and emphasise a

predominant social agenda – albeit, for instance, to enhance individuality (Mead 1928), or create concord (Radcliffe-Brown 1914). Evans-Pritchard meanwhile, advocates further investigation into the dance, both from the perspective of society, for its potential to socialise individuals and from the perspective of individuals, who may use dance for their own motives, in spite of such socialisation. More detailed study, he suggests, could yield further insight into the social value of dance (1928).

Functionalist studies such as those presented by Radcliffe-Brown (1914), Mead (1928), Bateson and Holt (1972 [1944]), and Boas (1972 [1944]) tended to seek explanations as to why people dance. These often referenced children and young people as well as adults, and tended to present dance in terms of socialisation. For instance, Radcliffe-Brown claimed the function of dance was to create social harmony, enjoyment and concord; Mead suggested it was to do encourage individuality and Boas suggested an initiation into the sacred as well as 'an opportunity for fun, demonstrations and horse-play' among explanations of the functions of the many dances permeating the daily lives of the Kwakiutl Indians of Vancouver Island, British Columbia (1972 [1944]: 17). Although they also considered the individuals involved, sometimes extensively considering Mead's psychological analysis, nonetheless the voices of such individuals often seem lacking, as the emphasis usually fell on the powerful agenda of society in its training attempts. After all it was the elders in society, not the shy child expected to dance, who set the standard value of 'individuality' expressed through dance.

For the Kwakiutl 'song and dance accompany all the events' of life. 'Practically every aspect of Kwakiutl life is accompanied by some form of dance, from the cradle to the grave' (1941: 5). Various dances take place on occasions such as war, the return of a war party (1941: 9-10) or when death comes. As noted, Boas presents the dance in this context as both a means of socialisation into a society's sacred rites, including initiation, and as play or entertainment. Bateson and Holt meanwhile suggest that one function of dance amongst the Balinese is to convey the sense of detachment and 'cold passion' which seems so valued in everyday social behaviour. (1972 [1944]: 61).

Radcliffe-Brown's consideration of dance for the Andamanese comes amidst his wider work on ritual for this people (1914). 'For the natives dance is both a means of enjoyment and also a ceremony.' (1914: 128). Listing several instances in which

Andamanese engage in dance including peace-making, before a fight, initiation ceremonies, pig and turtle eating ceremonies, the end of mourning and the close of hunting (1914: 128) he claims that the 'primary social function of the dance' is to produce a condition in which 'the unity, harmony and concord of the community are at a maximum, and in which they are intensely felt by every member.' (1914: 252)

Mead's study certainly highlights that 'dancing' 'in which almost all ages and both sexes participate' 'offers a unique opportunity for an analysis of education.' (1954 [1928]: 92) Children, she notes, often learn to clap before they learn to walk (1954 [1928]: 94). Mead notes a twofold significance of dance – to offset the rigourous subordination imposed by society on individuals in daily life and to encourage individuality as opposed to shyness.

However, while Mead calls dance 'a highly individual activity set in a social framework' (1954 [1928]: 92), nonetheless it is the social discipline imposed upon the individual which her study highlights (rather than the individual's self-discipline to match, resist or incorporate it). While the admonition may shift from the imperative 'Sit down and keep still!' to 'Stand up and dance!' (1954 [1928]: 97), the admonition still remains. The individual does not seem strengthened by his forced individuality - 'the Samoan child looks pained and anxious but dances just the same' (1954 [1928]: 98) - and those who do not display confidence in dance are deemed inferior by elders in society. Thus, in spite of Mead's interest in the psychological it seems her study is lacking in attention to the agent's perspective; the child's own experience of education through dance. Individuality is emphasised, but only as a social ideal.

Paul Spencer draws on Herbert Spencer's themes of dance's educational role and interaction within the dance (1985: 11) amongst several examples of functionalist theories that suggest 'dance as an organ of social control' (1985: 8). He writes that the functionalist model views dance 'as a governor, a constraining mechanism that limits any tendency towards anarchy.' (1985: 15) Where there is happiness or harmony experienced by the individuals who dance these are determined by society, as social ideals to be perpetuated. Such functionalist explanations, while perhaps seeking to address problematic social realities tend to emphasise the social hold over individuals in their dance practices. And while they all seem to touch upon both discipline and play

many seem to emphasise one or the other without exploring how they relate to one another (as Evans-Pritchard attempts), especially from an individual's perspective. As Paul Spencer critiques: 'the odds are heavily weighted in favour of the status quo.' (1985: 26).

Meanwhile, Evans-Pritchard's study of 'The Dance' (1928) attempts to elucidate its social value by examining it in the light of both discipline and concord, and the way in which it may link these, from the individual's perspective. In a structural-functional analysis of dance, in particular Azande dances at mortuary rituals in the Anglo-Egyptian Sudan, he critiques the limitations of functionalist explanations for the dance such as those of Radcliffe-Brown. Rather than casting universal explanations as to why people dance, which may not fit the reality of all dance examples in all societies, as shown by his study, he suggests exploring individuals' motives (1928: 460) as one way to provide a more detailed cinematographic picture. 'Radcliffe-Brown has not recognised the complexity of motives in the dance.' (1928: 460).

Like Mead, he notes the way society can use dance to discipline individuals; but also looks into how they can enjoy themselves around these measures. Although Mead suggests dance is key to the socialisation of infants and 'the dance is the earliest occasion on which the individual is introduced into a far wider society than the small family group' (1928: 457) unlike Mead's study emphasising the admonition of society toward shy and unwilling children initiated into it through dance, Evans-Pritchard seems to present a clearer picture of independence for the child and its willingness to take part (from an agentive perspective): 'When infants are able to walk they run and jump about outside the dance (1928: 458).

While Andamanese dance both to make peace and prepare for war and in conjunction with mourning (albeit at its end) Radcliffe-Brown does not explore a conflictive aspect within dance nor the discipline required to dance: two areas which Evans-Pritchard analysed in tandem with the enjoyment which the Azande apparently enjoyed in their Gbere Buda beer dances, particularly those practiced at mortuary feasts (1928). While these dances sometimes include 'free love' and armed fighting between individuals, yet these are managed within disciplinary codes (perhaps which recognise the requirements of the individual as well as those of society): 'the Zande beer dance is a well disciplined

affair.' (1928: 453). Indeed observers visiting from other tribes hail the Zande dance as evidence of the tribe's discipline; discipline being an attribute valued in the region. '.. the dances of other tribes never maintain the same degree of form and order.' (1928: 453).

Of course, socialisation can be ambiguous. While his study suggests how dance sets the scene for training individuals as to social expectations Evans-Pritchard indicates that dance studies can provide insights as to discipline not only instilled by society but also enacted by individuals in order to manage their own individual desires and pleasures, albeit within a framework that is socially accepted. His call for detailed study seems to indicate this ambiguity, one that dance anthropologists would continue to explore. Neveu Kringelbach, for instance, articulates the 'cool play' of Senegalese women who, within the context of their socialisation (2008: 2) in Dakar (which holds emotional restraint in high moral regard) nevertheless can – and do – enact a wider range of emotions in their particularly sensual *sabar* dances than in everyday life 'or at least... in a less restrained manner' (2008: 13).

III. IV Dance and learning: the individual's perspective

Recent works still comment on the training agendas of society in socialisation, although this is presented increasingly from what Farnell calls the 'agentive perspective' (1999: 357). Many dance studies since the 1980's focus particularly on learning processes in dance; some considering the response of individuals to cultural or national agendas for socialisation imposed through dance to promote national identity (Chakravorty 2004, Hughes-Freeland 2008, Daniel 1995, Wulff 2002, Wade 2000) while others consider socialisation taken up voluntarily by individuals choosing to enter dance communities (Potter 2008). Studies by Chakravorty (2004) and Hughes-Freeland (2008) and Potter's ethnography (2008) based on her fieldwork with contemporary dancers in London particularly address the individual dancer's agency in terms of her perceptive experience in learning.

Chakravorty (2004) writes of her experiential approach to analysis of Kathak dance and the emotion, particularly elation, she found in conjunction with the rigourous demands of training, suggesting a mastery of embodiment. 'I look at the body in *riaz*

(dance practice) to analyse the integration of mind and body through emotion or pleasure as explained in the Indian theory of *rasa*' (2004: 1). In her focus on the pleasurable element of dance training she seeks to show 'how the process of learning and practice within a rigid classical canon… does not necessarily produce passive, disciplined subjects devoid of agency.' (2004: 5-6). However, the fact that she also emphasises how local cultural gender identity or inequality is reinforced in Kathak dance, seems more to re-iterate the limit than enable the agency of dancers in the patriarchal society, outside the classroom. 'In the case of Kathak, or other classical dance forms of India, it (the social practice of the dance) is linked to the politics of cultural ideology in the formation of national identity [Chakravorty 2000].' (2004: 14). Those at eCdC also learned to combine discipline and emotions in the dance studio, although not just to feel empowered in this space in spite of limiting social conditions outside but also in order to address issues like inequality in the wider society (see Chapter IV).

Unlike Chakravorty's dancers, perpetuating social inequalities through their dance practice, several recent works including studies by Browning (1995), Hughes-Freeland (2008) Neveu Kringelbach (2005) seem to focus more strongly on how individuals use dance and the dance training they have undertaken in their bodily education to engage with the external forces of socialisation while retaining some inner essence or integrity; rather than other works which seem to focus on one or other of these or separating them into parallel instead of simultaneous experiences (Daniel 1995).

These studies indicate how individuals learn to manage realities of their socialisation (sometimes including their standard education) and in some cases how they attempt to master or build upon these through dance. All are particularly interesting in terms of a willing socialisation or re-education into self-selected societies, dance communities, and their ways of teaching and learning. These approaches, voluntarily taken up by individuals in the groups, often including the dance anthropologists studying them, shed light on the fascinating process or transformation of such agents in their body based education, as I also found from the examples of many at eCdC (see Chapter IV). In turn, they reveal key insights into self-discipline.

Hughes-Freeland (2008) highlights the desire to fuse inner essence ('batin') and outer social conduct ('lair') in Javanese court dance which she conveys as a particularly delicate and demanding challenge (2008: 80). It transpires that this practice like Chakravorty's Kathak dance, follows ideals in Javanese courtly dance of values espoused by Javanese ideology framing national identity, yet Hughes-Freeland explores how this can be mastered by individuals to their own benefit.

In the Tamansiswa educational system, the principle developed is that 'dance reflects the character of the person' resulting in 'a restricted set of physical practices and performance contexts becoming associated with an education in embodied self-control, which many Javanese Indonesians consider to be central to their identity.' (2008: 77) The practice may seem dominated by society rather than the desires of the individual and as such again questions the dancer's agency beyond the dance setting. However, as Hughes-Freeland writes: 'Although dancing is a form of disciplined social practice, it also provides an individual with resources to manoeuvre in the social world… We should not forget that dance-as-play never simply mirrors social practices, but is able to reverse them. An education in dance provides a means to undermine social rules and norms as well as embodying them…The metaphorical extension of ideas about action with respect to place enables connections to be made between dance and action which is socially approved.' (2008: 108).

Browning's work also addresses socialisation and learning to manage and master the social status quo — in particular, through dances of the Candomblé religion and the moves of capoeira, simultaneously a 'dance', a 'fight' and a 'game' (2004: 88).

In Candomblé, a religion coming from the African Yoruba tradition whose beliefs and practices were derived from those of the Yoruba people of Southwestern Nigeria (1995: 23), dancers acts as vessels for the orixas to use to transmit messages. As such, 'divinity makes itself present in the bodies of the dancers.' (1995: 23). To some extent this seems another example of internalised socialisation; while the external forces in this case are presented as the gods, it is of course society which perpetuates such an explanation. As Browning notes, 'meaning – readability – depends on the authority of the gods.' It is such external forces who 'have the power to shape our significance.' (1995: 50). As in Chakravorty's ethnography on Kathak dance, it seems surprising that Browning does

not question such a scenario in terms of the social force behind it, however much she understands the local explanation.

Still, the Candomblé is in itself an interesting example of a strategy which seems to run through several dances in Brazil and hence connect various cultures in the wider national culture. This is a kind of syncretism, illustrated through various dances as much as other studied practices. As Browning connects: '...if part of the genius of African religion in Brazil is syncretism; its ability to absorb or account for Catholic or other systems, part of capoeira's genius has also been its ability to absorb rather than be displaced by other forms. It is a survival tactic consistent with the premise of the game.' (1995: 102). In Candomblé this syncretic tactic is shown through the incorporation of the worship of Catholic deities and festivities amongst that of the Yoruban orixas. This certainly expresses a way of managing and potentially mastering a social status quo which might seek to subjugate indigenous or African traditions below the dominant Catholicism enforced by Portuguese colonisers. 'Candomblé is a syncretic faith, product of a violent cultural encounter. It demands not only a comparison of Catholic and Yoruba beliefs but also their mutual approximation.' (1995: 43).

A similar notion of syncretism is also conveyed in the strategies of capoeira. Capoeira's various identities including a game, a fight and a dance (1995: 88) seem as deliberate as its endless inversions, ironies, witticisms and riddles which it takes on in order not only to survive but also to thrive in society. For again, like the Candomblé, capoeira is an African derived form, brought to Brazil and developed chiefly by slaves seeking forms of resistance to European oppressors. While it began as a mode of resistance (like a fight) against European colonisers it later became presented as an aesthetic spectacle (like a dance) to be 'played' (like a game), in order to engage with society in public spaces. Its perhaps most widely known form, '*Capoeira Angola*', comes, as the name suggests, from Angola. In this practice, moves seek both to comment on society's ironies amongst practitioners, whilst engaging others in what often seems a somewhat playful manner, in spite of its other associations. 'Many of capoeira's manoeuvres are inversions, whether literal or ironic, physical or linguistic.' (1995: 121) The idea, argues Browning, is not to fight (the dominant society) but rather to incorporate it, or turn it metaphorically on its head as a social comment communicated to others. This notion is

well expressed by the feat of the capoeirista, grinning upside down, mid-cartwheel, or in the gesture of a high kick, ironically termed 'bencao' or blessing (1995: 121). Similarly, many at eCdC, including Álvaro himself and Lobadys, use dance partly as a viable means to address serious social issues. However, unlike the intended audiences of capoeiristas who need first to know the codes to understand the messages in the moves, the social messages expressed in eCdC's dance shows are aimed to reach a wide public (see Chapter IV).

Meanwhile, in Senegal, Neveu Kringelbach argues that individuals seek to transform their social status through contemporary dance; showing how dance is taken up voluntarily as individuals pursue social mobility. In contrast with the seemingly internalised subjugation of women reiterated in Kathak dance in Chakravorty's study, Neveu Kringelbach argues that Senegalese contemporary dancers, such as women, can transform their social status through dance, affecting social mobility (2005: 26). Her 'emphasis on the dance highlights the subtle processes through which dominant gender discourses are contested.' (2005: 27). During the sabar dances women organise in Dakar, 'the norms of restraint are visibly contested' (2008: 6).

The learning of these styles alone seems to require practitioners to transcend the demands of their erstwhile educations in order to allow for other approaches. However, importantly, this is not in order to reject but rather to build upon these earlier approaches and in so doing to incorporate them into the new self-education and agency underway.

What Browning, recalling from capoeira master Pastinha's instructive riddles, calls the 'no in the yes, the big in the little, the earth in the sky, the fight in the dance' (1995: 108) can be applied both to the religious syncretism prevalent throughout Brazil today but also to learning styles as expressed through dance, as individuals willingly enact their own re-education.

Browning experiences a kind of first-hand re-education, from the body, through dance, (as had Jackson [1983] amongst others) in her apprenticeship of several dance forms. Learning the Candomblé techniques of 'bodily writing', using her body as a medium for the messages of Yoruban orixas, she suspends her natural inclination to write

literally in order to prioritise dancing as writing. In this way she follows and honours local idioms of practitioners of Candomblé, whose dances illustrate the highest form of education in this religion, as they actually 'constitute part of its liturgy' (1995: 36). As such they could not be held in higher esteem as a foremost means to impart religious education itself. Her literal writing, as ordered by her 'mae de santos' – Mother of Saints - or guiding priestess, must come only secondary to, and in the service of, dance. (1995: 36-37)

The improvisation and creativity inherent in all the dance contexts chosen by the anthropologists mentioned above, certainly indicates an anthropological interest in dance styles that illustrate syncretic mastery, and the integrative, interactive and improvisational, taking in influences whilst encouraging agency and creativity.

Potter (2008) emphasises the voluntary socialisation of dancers into a contemporary dance community in London. Here she addresses the realities of sensory modalities crucial to contemporary dancers training in London, including attention to senses of motion, heat and touch. She finds that even within a culture that seems familiar, such as that of the UK, there are communities ('sub-groups') such as the contemporary dance school in London where she conducted fieldwork, whose practices demonstrate a different system of valuing the senses to what Geurts calls the 'classic five' taught in standard western schools. (2008: 445).

Potter suggests that a 'shifted sensorium', turning from these classic senses to those she finds most valued by communities like her dance school (which prioritises senses of motion – 'kinaesthesia', heat and pain, while valuing touch and sound more than the other classic senses in contrast to the standards of society or the 'non-dancing world') is both possible and necessary to the transformation of these dancers from students to professionals. In turn, this suggests an emphasis on intentional re-education as a topic within dance anthropology. (2008: 446). Potter herself takes up the experiential challenge of managing this shifted sensorium which demands some concerted effort, even with her twenty years' experience of dance (see Chapter IV).

Thus some of these dance anthropologists experience a re-education of sorts themselves as they volunteer a socialisation into their dance communities by participating in

dancing. Certainly many had dance training prior to reaching their fields. Still, they reveal that learning their respective dances according to local pedagogies was often challenging and unfamiliar. Potter finds her dance training, as a part of her research, to be at times physically exhausting (2008: 447) and rigorous in discipline, as she learns to re-learn while integrating this with her former learning, and similar struggles were also noted by anthropologists including Jackson (1983), Farnell (1994) and Browning (1995).

All these studies certainly emphasise a theme of mastery pursued in dance training: whether to undermine social rules in Java (Hughes-Freeland 2008), to transform social status in Senegal (Neveu Kringelbach 2005), to cast ironic commentary upon or invert the status quo in Brazil (Browning 1995), to learn to re-learn through other senses in a dance school (Potter 2008) or simply for these anthropologists to take on an experiential approach to analysis (Chakravorty 2004).

Moreover, the fact that anthropologists such as Chakravorty, Browning, Potter and the dancers they studied have selected their bodily education with dance suggests an agency perhaps quite unlike that of many children in descriptions of dance as a means of socialisation in early anthropology, pointing towards a voluntary re-education and an aim to master alternative approaches. Studies by Potter and Browning seem particularly interesting in this regard as they address voluntary re-education or selective socialisation into dance communities: Potter's contemporary dance school in London and the capoeira circles and Candomblé communities Browning researched in Brazil. In contrast especially to early views of dance in anthropology as a kind of imposed socialisation, these studies seem to present a very different picture of dance, as a chosen re-education in which participants seek to master ways of learning and skills which often question their early socialisation or childhood education.

Interestingly, the individuals in Potter's field site have chosen to become socialised into this community. It is not their immediate society but one they have volunteered to join in spite of a different education in another context. This sub-group is 'defined by the bodily experience of their chosen occupation.' (2008: 446) Here they learn to learn through the body. However, prior to arrival and throughout their training they also continue to learn in literate ways (2008: 460-1), suggesting a re-education which does

not reject but rather adds to their other experiences of learning. Similarly, individuals at my field site, eCdC, chose to enter into this unusual school community and many felt their learning here complimented their more formal education from their regular schools (see Chapter IV).

III. V Dance as pedagogy: towards a re-education

Finally, a case has been made in recent dance anthropology that dance training and studies in dance could be of benefit to regular education today, suggesting its re-application into society as a means of education in itself, again highlighting the self- and intersubjective discipline inherent in re-socialisation. This time, rather than be socially trained perhaps these individuals seek to re-train society.

Farnell expresses her dismay that there were 'no departments of dance at universities (in the 1960's) 'a state of affairs that sent out a loud and clear message: the academic world completely devalued what I found most meaningful.' (in Buckland 1999: 145). Meanwhile, Hanna urges that dance studies be included seriously in schools, arguing how some lessons of dance, such as contact improvisation techniques learned in contemporary dance, could even help shape a viable pedagogy in itself for many children (Hanna 1999).

Certainly this resonates with social values promoted by contemporary dance practices. As explored by dance ethnographers including Thomas (2003) and Potter (2008), contact improvisation exercises transmit notions of equality, trust and respect between individuals, as I also found in my fieldwork (see chapter IV). In contrast both to more established dance forms such as ballet and in contrast to prioritisations in conventional educational practices, the values conveyed in such exercises could yield disciplinary insights for wider social contexts, outside dance studies, such as regular school and various challenging social realities.

In *Partnering Dance and Education: Intelligent Moves for Changing Times* (1999) Hanna argues how dance could be made central to every student's education by pointing out the relevance of dance education beyond the studio. Amongst its uses, she claims that dance can be a teaching tool for both academic and social workplace skills; for instance, informing students about issues of gender, health, national identity and cultural

diversity. Amongst others, this could be particularly useful for 'at-risk youth' by helping to foster 'personal development' (1999: 98-100) and 'citizenship responsibility' (1999: 100). This, in itself, shows how, not only in anthropology but also in real life educational settings dance study can yield valuable insights into managing social concerns such as those provoked by discriminations of gender, race or class, which are often connected to bodily violence.

Indeed, Neveu Kringelbach also notes the social educational scope of dance in Senegal beyond dance settings, as it is taken up as a theme by individuals in their homes: 'Whenever there are interpersonal tensions watching a dance video allows people to find common ground.' (2005: 248). As noted, Browning also explores how the learning of styles like capoeira can and do subsequently help practitioners towards an improved social experience by engaging with society in entertaining (while empowering) public displays (1995).

Perhaps most pertinently, Hanna's study shows how dance considered as leisure or 'free play' in schools, and kept for recreational breaks if included at all, can in fact be moved to the classroom and taken up as a teaching tool. Certainly many of those who had taken part in dance education at eCdC expressed the benefits of this as much in their daily experience of learning at the school as in the way they could implement this body based education both here and in society outside, in order to address social concerns with creative solutions of their own through dance (see Chapter IV).

Clearly dance has come far in anthropology, from being treated as only an aspect of studies on topics such as ritual, perhaps at times addressed all too briefly in terms of its social value, to being more carefully analysed for its joyful, playful and disciplinary worth for the individual in society. Following its valuable links with education and learning, dance has even been noted for its potential contribution to pedagogy, in schools today. (Hanna 1999, Thomas 2003).

IV Discipline and Happiness

'A child normally goes to school, it sits down, they bombard it with stories, I don't know what, but there it is sat down. Yet they never teach you to respect each other, the respect for each other's things, or knowing you have dignity, rights, duties… Not everyone does an activity in which they have to have contact with another person, where they really feel that relationship, that shows which values they are discovering.' – *Vivian Orozco, eCdC graduate, dancer and teacher.*

In studying how a body based education can inform understandings of discipline, it seems pertinent to seek the perspective of individuals as to their understanding of discipline in such a setting, in their own experience. This seems appropriate, both in the context of recent dance anthropology with its emphasis on the agent's perspective (Farnell 1999: 357) and since Foucault's major study of discipline (1975) seems to neglect such agency (as discussed in Chapter I), even excluding the voices of those he described being disciplined.

From the narratives of individuals at eCdC, I found that many employed self- and intersubjective discipline to address various tensions, which have also be been considered problematic in anthropology as the separated and often opposing terms of Cartesian dualisms. While anthropologists and others use the methodology of embodiment as a means of theoretically resolving these divides, in response to their own desires, the individuals at eCdC also seem to seek similar integrations, in their actual way of being, throughout their everyday lives. They seem to actualise aspects of the methodology of embodiment, live, albeit without using the academic term.

In joining the school many seemed to seek to build upon their socialisation by pursuing an education atypical to their society. For some, in deciding to train in its program for dance careers they also acted in spite of external social pressures to prepare for other, better socially regarded and financially secure, professions. Thus in this decision and arrival they enacted behaviour (Strathern and Stewart 2011) of their own choosing, challenging the forecast of Foucault and Bourdieu as to the objectification of the

individual, his conditioned action or his disciplining in the grip of society.

Once at the school, many students seemed as interested by eCdC's body based philosophy and pedagogy (the ethic of the body, the body at the centre of education, the thinking body, having as well as being bodies, learning in motion and in direct tactile contact) as the activities there. Accordingly, they seemed to employ self-discipline to pursue various kinds of embodiment. In particular: they sought to align mind and body or think from the body in perception or feeling (not only by means of conception, as is more often emphasised in western, Aristotelian philosophy), and to focus on the body's intent. For this they also learned to learn in motion. As Jackson and Farnell emphasise, the living experience of the body as the ground of perception – which Merleau-Ponty suggests - may still not quite capture a person's agency with *intent*, unlike the living *moving* experience of the body. This seems seconded by Gibson (1986 [1979]: 258) and Ingold (2000: 166) who emphasise the value of motion for perception and in turn, learning, or information pickup in one's environment. Such conscious daily enactments of aspects of what is addressed in academic terms as embodiment seem rare in regular school contexts, although perhaps not in the dance world.

In finding the self-discipline to learn to learn in motion many students also learned to shift their sensorium to develop senses pertinent to a given setting or community – in this case, a body based educational community – which prioritised motion as a key sense, even as it fell outside the 'classic five' typical to western education. Equally they developed senses within the 'classic five' but which were often under-emphasised or under-valued in western sensual hierarchies and schools, such as touch, as an aid to body-based learning.

Meanwhile interacting with others with direct contact, they used an intersubjective discipline to develop 'humanistic' or social as well as personal values, including trust, respect and equality, needed not just for activities like lifting, guiding, holding and leading others in the studio but also in life beyond it. Many of the students to whom I spoke seemed attracted to the school's somewhat embodying philosophy (or encouragement to address what are also Cartesian divides) as it promoted these values.

These were learned from the moving body, moving amongst other bodies and by touching and being touched by other bodies. They were not only ideas received from superiors, internalised by those at eCdC but actually tested out in practice and responded to by students amongst themselves.

Moreover various students seemed intent to transmit their body based education outside eCdC. They invited further intersubjective discipline, by taking their learning from the studio and into society, to use it to reach and communicate with others. In this way they built upon their socialisation once more – seeking to merge gaps between practice and structure, the individual and society, by attempting and promoting (re-) integrations of these.

All of the above agent- or intention-driven endeavours (perhaps unusual in more conventional western disciplinary settings, particularly those discussed by Foucault) seemed challenging but were experiences that nonetheless many claimed and seemed to enjoy, combining discipline with happiness as much as collapsing the (Cartesian) tensions noted.

IV. I Self-discipline: choosing a body based education

Foucault writes: 'Discipline "makes" individuals; it is the specific technique of a power that regards individuals both as objects and as instruments of its exercise.' (1977 [1975]: 170). In his understanding of discipline, as traced by his major work on the topic (1975), society disciplines individuals, who in turn, internalise this process. Thus discipline is a technology of power imposed upon the individual by others and where the individual has any agency it is only to internalise this imposition. If he is an agent he is an agent of his own socialisation – much like Bourdieu's (1977 [1972]: 86) and even Mauss's (1973 [1934]: 71-2) socially conditioned individual.

For many individuals at eCdC, by contrast, their very decision to join the school demonstrated considerable self-discipline and agency, not to conform to but rather, to act in spite of external pressures, or expectations experienced in their early socialisation, particularly as children. In their action to enter into a body based education many

showed a will to build upon their socialisation and the action it tended to frame, in contrast with Bourdieu's conditioned predicament. For the staff of the school especially, this socialisation included Colombia's context of political violence committed against bodies, particularly through its long-running modern armed conflict. In Restrepo's case, it also included his physically violent school experience. Meanwhile students more often acted from the context of more local realities of social and racial disparities in Cartagena and the expectations of their families as to their professional choices.

Equally, for staff and students alike, eCdC provided an environment quite unlike any of their experiences of (regular) school, most of which were more conventional by social standards and less attentive to the body. In choosing a body based education 'with dance' therefore, as children, and for some, choosing to pursue such training 'for dance' as a vocation, they began to question their earlier socialisation: at home with their families, in their locales, as Colombian citizens and as children learning from more mainstream local education practices.

Taking up this additional education required considerable discipline in itself. Although the individuals had chosen to pursue it (and for many, their classes here at eCdC were subsidised by the government or others rather than financed by families), they had to organise it around their regular schooling at least until the age of sixteen. Many, like Eduard, started around the age of eleven years old. 'We came to school (eCdC) in the morning', he says, 'and ate (here) because we could have lunch and then returned for the normal classes at home. I came back to my house at night, I left in the morning and returned at seven at night. So I practically just came home to eat and sleep.' The stamina to do this in terms of the timing and the will to do it in spite of eCdC's contrasting approach compared to regular school certainly required a discipline and agency in the children neglected in studies by Bourdieu and Foucault.

Often their families had their own concerns about their education from the perspective of social standards and values in Colombia and more pragmatically, in terms of their pursuing a profession that allowed them to eat. Lobadys remembers, 'In the beginning it was like, "You're crazy. How are you going to do dance? We need to eat.."'

Melissa, who had moved from Bogotá, says 'the change is hard. As a physical change – and a cultural change it's really tough, I'm not going to deny it.' Others, as noted, had moved from other Colombian cities such as Cali, and Gunlodd had come all the way from Reykjavik.

For those choosing to dedicate themselves to dance as a career, from the age of sixteen, there were financial and professional issues to consider amidst the risks of deviating from standard social practice or expectations. Vivían, now a professional dancer and dance teacher explains: 'Obviously here (in Colombia) it is much more important to have a degree such as lawyer, doctor, accountant, economist… if you're going to earn in the future and be able support your life: your lifestyle, your quality of life. Here this is of great importance. For example they say that a dancer earns the same as a doctor or lawyer, but (dance) wasn't registered as a profession. So obviously in the beginning my parents didn't agree… I had to convince them that the work wasn't just dancing, it was also using the body as a tool, a tool to teach, to do other things, not just dance.'

The decision presented emotional challenges to many of the students, like Frey, whose family was also perplexed. 'I played football, I was in a course for the youth police… When I decided (to join eCdC), when I finished my school certificate, I had one of the biggest arguments I've ever had with my mum, because as I said before, actually I was into football, I was with the police. And then she always saw me as "that kid… he's a little rascal. The dance thing, oh, it will all be over soon". And I didn't let her think that any more. I was always involved in dance, and that was how I would make something of myself. But even then, when I finished my certificate, she traveled to Bogotá and told me that I should finish my studies and come too.

'When I went she told me: "I need your diploma, your school certificate, because I've already been making some enquiries around here so you get onto the police force." Because I have a cousin who's in the police, and that was an opening for me, and she was just going to go and introduce me. And I said, "What?" And she said, "Yes, yes, you just go, on this day, and introduce yourself." 'I said, "But mum, I don't want to be a policeman, I'm a dancer. And I'm studying in the Colegio." Then she said, "No, no no… That was when you were little. Now you have to think about your future, about

what you're going to do—"

'And I said, "no". I mean, with all the respect and love that I have for her, I told her "no". I cried… We cried… So much. She told me that she wouldn't be able to help me, because she couldn't if she was in Bogotá. That if I went to another city then she would have no way of doing it, that I was on my own. That I should count on her support, but that she couldn't help me, that I should take the decision and think what it was that I wanted to do. So I came here. And I'm here, I've lived all this time here alone, dancing, learning, living, fighting… teaching, enjoying dance. And getting to know the skill more, because I was such a young age when I left my mother, her protection.'

While choosing to enter a dance community was important for some what seemed particularly important for many was the element of education itself in this dancing community— choosing to enter into an 'education with dance', a body based education, in contrast to the more regular education with which they were all more familiar. Whereas students in Potter's case study for instance, sought to be socialised 'into the professional dance community' (2008: 4) and some students at eCdC also joined up with this intention, many more, it seemed, had very different (and ranging) motives to join, which were often separate from their career aspirations, at least at a young age. Some wanted to be dancers when they started but others hoped to fuse their 'education with dance' with their hopes for other professions in fields such as neurology, anthropology, music and graphic design, or with creative social initiatives of their own, as seen in some of my informants' stories (in Chapter II).

The socialisation from which they joined eCdC included their earlier or primary educational experience of learning in more regular (non body based) schools, in which the body was required to be still in class, as suggested by Foucault's 'docile bodies' in disciplinary institutions. As noted, Vivían's understanding of discipline in regular schools was of a child being 'sat down' and 'bombarded with stories' – rather than encouraging his or her agency, subjectivity, movement or interaction with others.

eCdC's co-director Álvaro himself experienced a more 'regular' education as a child, in a prestigious North American-run Benedictine school for boys in Bogotá which seemed

to follow a more Cartesian, Aristotelian approach, keeping bodies sat still in class, separate from a disembodied intellect. Where bodies were active was outside class, in sport sessions, and where they were contacted, in his experience, it was not with good reason. He personally encountered a violent objectification of the body in the discipline imposed by staff, in a manner recalling Foucault's insights into discipline and punishment. 'They hit us with sticks. On my first day, when I was six years old, a nun hit me until my nose bled.' He wrote about these memories as chronicles, published in a well-regarded Colombian magazine, *Numero (Edition 55)*, for which he received the highly esteemed *Simon Bolivar National Journalism Prize for Best Chronicle or Reportage* in 2007. His article, 'Llora et Labora' ('Cry and Work'), a revision of his school motto: *Ora et Labora* – ('Pray and Work'), recalls a string of abuses, psychological and physical. 'That first year a neverending initiation ritual is constituted that the child will never erase from his skin.' (Restrepo 2007 – separata - IV). Writing the piece was 'an exorcism'.

He might have internalised his experience into adulthood or recoiled from being involved in educational contexts again. Instead, however, his answer to his 'nightmare', this 'very physical and very violent education, on my body' — and indeed on a larger scale, as part of his vision: his answer to Colombia's violence inflicted on the body – was to create 'a school *for* the body, where you could enjoy the body. Where you could live in your body with pleasure and with dignity.'

'If you ask me, "Why El Colegio del Cuerpo?" it's because of all of this. It was my way of healing myself. I had fellow students who went nuts. There were some who committed suicide. There are some who were very well domesticated and they think the education they received was fantastic – and it was necessary, and it was justified. I don't. I never justify violence against the body. It's as simple as that. There's no reason why you can beat a child.' Outside his experience of discipline at school, whose bodily links (for him) were so negative, he, like the dancers, sought a very different kind of community.

'I think we want to bring the body back to the centre of the educational experience. We have to go back to basics; the most simple reality of what we are, which is our own

body.' While this being in the body – reiterated by Merleau-Ponty - may be the starting point or foundation of eCdC, the fact that here the body's movement and agency is emphasised, every moment of the day, suggests that, as Jackson and Farnell posit, embodiment be understood particularly for intention and agency. Although for Foucault the body was certainly at the centre of the educational process, it was here as a docile object of manipulation or agent of internalisation, not an agent of an individual's intent.

Many of the students at eCdC were drawn, like Álvaro, to an environment that acknowledged and respected the body. Many were attracted not only to its programs in education with dance but also to the philosophy of the school, for both its multisensorial, whole-bodied focus and its humanistic pedagogy, promoting interactive discipline and social values, through dance. Lobadys 'liked this combination very much. It really caught my attention, that combination of professionalism and social human, or humanistic education.'

'I think that was one of the things that most motivated me to continue (with eCdC)', remembers Frey. 'The philosophy it has. That my body is important. That I have to look after it. That I am important too because of what I am, not because of what I have. When I listened to my teacher talk, I was really little and I liked it, because neither in the school where I studied, nor where I studied primary school, nor even in the certificate that I was studying did they speak like that. There wasn't that care, that respect for your own body. More than dance, because I learned that later, the greatest motivation for me was the philosophy. Afterwards, well, that remained with me. At home, with my friends, I was different.'

As Eduard explains: 'In any case the project (eCdC) isn't just teaching young people and children to dance. There is a philosophy and a concept. The fact of having the body at the centre of all the philosophy of El Colegio del Cuerpo has touched us all. It's been a part of our process during all the years we've been here. So when we teach that is very apparent. You realise that there is a concept, that there is an idea, that it transforms itself, and that it shares with all the other students and with other people who attend.'

For many this concept about the body was a major motivation to join. Unlike Chakravorty's dancers (2004) who enact, and perhaps internalise, their government's choice of what should be their national identity as they train in Kathak dance in a classroom and Hughes-Freeland's dancers (2008) who tend to focus more on the techniques of the courtly Javanese dances they learn than on their underlying philosophy (also meant to shape national identity) various students at eCdC seemed just as interested in exploring philosophies behind their practices at the school as they were in the practices themselves.

They had willingly taken up this re-education, and in enacting their intention had become agents of their own disciplinary process. Moreover, their decision to join a dance school as young as eCdC chiefly promoting contemporary dance, a non-traditional Colombian form, albeit as a medium for education, clearly was not in line with any government wish or agenda to shape national identity. In this case, quite by contrast, the contemporary dance specialisation in the teaching at eCdC questions what individuals might have otherwise learned in their socialisation, both in terms of former dance training such as ballet or Colombian folkloric dance and their former schooling.

This goes against the thinking on socialisation and conditioning and treatment of the body and individual through his practice by Bourdieu, Foucault's earlier work on society's disciplining of docile bodies in schools amongst institutions, and Mauss on the socially acquired techniques of the body, claiming 'each society has its own habits' (1973 [1934]: 71-2). Instead, it seems to run more in line with the thinking of their critics who point out their over-objectification of the individual and under-emphasis of his agency, for all Bourdieu's attempt at habitus as a study of embodiment to bridge the Cartesian gap between individual and society. Yet, it certainly resonates with Foucault's later thought on agency or technologies of the self and his interest in 'the way the individual governs or transforms himself… in order to attain a certain state of happiness…' (1988: 18).

IV. II Self-discipline: seeking embodiment at eCdC

Once at eCdC, students willingly experienced a different kind of learning, a re-education, according to some, in contrast to their regular schooling, by moving from a disembodied to an embodied education. For here, every day, many strive, as agents, toward what has been another focus of embodiment in anthropology: thinking from the body (rather than limiting or relegating thinking to the mind, as per Cartesian models). Several students discussed the value of embodied learning through the thinking body by bringing the body (back) into the thought process or recognising a bodily intelligence. As Melissa said: 'I'm completely in agreement with the idea of multiple intelligences, in that, yes, there are very rational people, very, let's say, well-equipped to think, but there are other forms of intelligence, like that of the body.'

This bodily intelligence according to one director entailed both a thinking and perceiving body – two notions perhaps somewhat under-emphasised in conventional disciplinary institutions as abilities to develop and ideals to reach toward. Yet, at eCdC it was clear that students like Melissa highly valued these notions, which they addressed in their daily experience.

Melissa explained that one goal she aspired to when she danced was to align body and head so that she could trust her body to think. 'When I feel confident, like I am able to dance… body and head have to be aligned. Sometimes your head is doing more work, and your body less, so you think you've got it, but when you do it, in reality it's not clear in your body. So when finally you feel you've learned something it's like you don't have to think about it, that it becomes something less rational. That's the moment when you can enjoy it: when the body already knows and it's almost like it tells you. That moment, I believe, is the moment you have to reach.'

This thinking from the body is not simply a transfer of thinking from the mind to the body but rather an integrative thinking of the body as a whole, including perception and conception – a thinking as well as a feeling in the body. It is very much emphasised in the philosophy of the school. As Álvaro explains 'I think we learn, not just with our heads, with our intellects, but we learn through the senses, through our imagination, through intuition— through perception, not just conception'.

To some extent this recalls Merleau-Ponty's notion of the body as the existential ground for perceiving the world: 'I think we share the same nature in all our human dimensions so we not only think with all our body but we feel with all our body. It's a total organ, with which we perceive the world; the reality.' Of course Merleau-Ponty's emphasis is on the pre-objective experience of the living body, as opposed to its objective treatment – including that stressed by Bourdieu and Foucault. However, as Jackson and Farnell emphasise, this lived experience perhaps underplays the intent of the living body and thus under-emphasises the power of its agency. Farnell argues it could seem that Merleau-Ponty has simply shifted the focus from one Cartesian term (object/society/mind) to another (subject/individual/body). As Merleau-Ponty replaced Déscartes' 'I think' with 'I can' as a ground for experience, Farnell extends this to 'I can *act*.' (1994: 934). Thus Farnell and Jackson, as well as those at eCdC, emphasise the perception of the living *moving* body – a notion which seems to encapsulate both perception and conception from the body.

Álvaro illustrates the notion of the body's feeling, with intent, with the story of 'The Centipede and the Toad', a tale much adapted in the wake of the original poem, attributed to Katherine Craster (1871) which has since generated significant intrigue; leading to the term in psychology: '*The Centipede's Dilemma*.' He tells the following version:

'There was a centipede who was a wonderful dancer. He was a very famous and renowned dancer and he would always go near home to train every morning; to do his ballet class. He would have his barre and he would be there and do his many plieés and all the routine of a classical ballet dancer. And there was this toad who was always looking at him from a distant rock. He was very jealous of him. He hated him because he thought he was so beautiful and so skilled and so well trained. So he would look at him every morning and he would feel a lot of anger. One day he said, "I have to really ruin the career of this centipede dancer. I'm gonna write him a letter." So he wrote him a letter and he left it on a rock. He wrote:

"Oh, dear God of Dance, You're so beautiful. I admire you so much. You're such a wonderful dancer. I want to imitate you, I want to be like you. But I want you to please tell me: What are your secrets? How do you manage to move your leg number 47 at the same time you do a forte-bras with your arm 92 and at

the same time your foot 64 is moving with your hand 23? Oh, please, God of Dance, tell me how you coordinate all this?"

So, the next day, the centipede arrives for his daily training and he finds the letter. And the toad is looking at him, from far away. And he takes the letter and he's delighted and thrilled to have it. And he takes the letter and he starts – "Oh… yah…" - analysing. "How do I do to make my arm 47 move with my leg 92…..?"

He starts thinking that he'll have to give up dancing, forever. There was something that paralysed him when he started to think too much.'

Of course it summarises well the problem of separating mind and body, albeit in order to attempt to study movement; since movement implies intention in itself (Jackson 1989, Farnell 1994), and as such both perception and conception from the body (Csordas 1994: xii). As Álvaro says, 'This is a story I like to tell my dancers when I see they are thinking too much.'

An (embodied) alignment is clearly an important focus of discipline in such a body based educational context and individuals at eCdC must discipline themselves to learn to involve and trust the moving body in their education, in contrast with their former schooling. As the centipede loses his confidence when he stops dancing to analyse his steps – indicating a failure to move when he prioritises analysis from a static position, Ingold and Gibson also highlight the value of motion for perception and in turn, knowing (and learning as a means to knowing). Gibson explains how movement can allow one to perceive – particularly to see, since by moving one may look *around* rather than simply looking *at*. (1986 [1979]: 203). 'In order to look around, of course, one must turn one's head.' Meanwhile, he says, 'Knowing is an extension of perceiving.' (1986 [1979]: 258). Thus it can be understood that by moving, one can know; in perhaps a more encompassing way than simply by seeing.

Following Gibson's thought, Ingold reiterates that in Gibson's ecological psychology (a branch of his studies in visual perception), in contrast with the cognitive science approach, 'the emphasis on movement is critical' – since 'perceptual activity consists not in the operation of the mind upon the bodily data of sense, but in the intentional movement of the whole being (indissolubly body and mind) in its environment.' (2000:

166).

Ingold himself illustrates his understanding of the value of intentional movement for perception and knowing, (as in Chapter I), by emphasising that cognition (rather than being interpreted from the perspective of a mind, 'organising the bodily data of sense') in fact implicates, 'the whole body-person in the business of dwelling in the world' (2000: 163), both receiving and responding to information (2000: 165).

Thus he and Gibson, like Jackson (1983) and Farnell (1994), emphasise the experience of the moving body in perception and learning. Again, this contrasts sharply with Foucault's docile bodies (1977 [1975]). Meanwhile it echoes the notion that the stillness of bodies can hinder learning, as found by Vivían and Álvaro (and the centipede).

Interestingly, as Potter found in her fieldwork with contemporary dancers, while kinetic energy was 'connected to warmth and the flow of fluids (e.g. blood, odours)' and indicates vitality 'stillness is associated with coldness and may designate illness, injury, or the absence of life force.' (2008: 459). Considering this association in conjunction with the philosophy of individuals at eCdC, education promoting the stillness of bodies seems a questionable training for life.

Álvaro laments the lack of movement in learning in his school experience: 'I think that, in my own personal case, if I would have had a more bodily education – for mathematics, for physics, for geometry, for ethics, for everything, I would have enjoyed much more and I would have *learned* much more than what I did. I was so *bored* during my eleven years or twelve years in school, sitting there, still, in this desk. We had to sit with our hands like this (gestures hands clasped together) during class. You know, it was like having handcuffs! And I'm sure if somebody would have taught me the law of gravity through movement, or friction, through movement, or I don't know – geometry… I'm fascinated by geometry. Today I think, "I love mathematics!" even though I know nothing, and I didn't learn anything in school. I love mathematics the same way as I love Johan Sebastian Bach – because I think Bach is mathematics. And now I understand this. But during my twelve school years it was a torture.'

At eCdC movement was clearly highly prioritised. This was perhaps not surprising for a community specialised, like Potters informants, in the medium of contemporary dance (2008). However, it does seem interesting in the context of dance with education or education with dance; a pedagogy to be extended beyond dance, due partially to what touch and movement can contribute to learning and thus how they might inform understandings of discipline.

Recognising the senses valued by a given community and the ways in which they understand this value is emphasised by anthropologists such as Geurts (2002), Jackson (1983), Farnell (1994), Ingold (2000) and Stoller (1989). Stoller writes, 'Although anthropologists, like painters, lend their bodies to the world, we tend to allow our senses to penetrate the other's world rather than letting our senses be penetrated by the world of the other.' (1989: 39). Meanwhile, where anthropologists have also noted a sensorium that has been shifted amongst members of a community, they have often tried to integrate such an experience in their own participation in the field.

Noting the shifting sensorium (while attending to senses valued and ways of knowing) experienced by those they studied, several anthropologists themselves, including Jackson (1983) and Potter (2008: 446) took up the discipline, using their (moving) bodies as a resource, to gain some idea of this experience— a possibility Blacking had noted in the study of the body in the social (unlike the natural) sciences: 'the observer's body may serve as a diagnostic tool' (1977: 5). A sense of motion while learning and thinking with the body, without over-analysing the process – have also been themes which have challenged them. As opposed to participant observation in fieldwork, Hsu calls this 'participant experience.' (1999: 15-17)

For several, including Browning and Potter, this challenge in fact demanded the discipline to suspend the more familiar ways of learning (and writing, as in Browning's case) in order to give primacy to the dance and learning through the body. Browning and Potter have done so in accordance with the sensory worlds of the people at their fieldsites – some of whom, like those at eCdC, have shifted their own sensoriums in electing to join such communities.

While Potter and Browning had many years of dance experience prior to embarking on

their field work in dance communities, their educational backgrounds or basic ways of learning were literacy-based, as far as they suggest in these works. Consequently they had to re-socialise themselves into their chosen settings. Potter finds also finds the non-classic sense of kinaesthesia to be one of those most highly valued amongst the contemporary dancers at her London dance school fieldsite and that here, touch and sound in particular from amongst the classic five senses 'are given explicit attention to levels beyond those explicitly experienced in day-to-day life.' (2008: 455-6). Significantly she contrasts this with Aristotelian models, prioritising sight, and emphasises connections between all the senses which she suggests are 'to be understood as an intermeshed web of perceptory apparatuses.' (2008: 445-6).

Thus these anthropologists, through disciplined attempts in their participant experience to shift the sensorium or learn through the body, can attest to some experiential interpretation of the discipline required in the actions of those in their fieldsites (although perhaps not the very same experience or 'common ground where self and other are one' [Jackson {1983: 340}], as Varela [1992] and Farnell [1994: 936-7] point out, critiquing Jackson's 'romantic' assertion).

At eCdC, individuals seem to learn to shift their sensorium to accommodate a sense of motion as a top priority, amongst daily challenges and disciplined adjustment in their body based education after their more regular (and comparatively disembodied schooling).

I also danced in my participation in two classes at eCdC in order to attempt to learn how to learn through the body, following the pedagogical model of individuals at the school. I found these classes challenging; not only as a newcomer to contemporary dance but especially as I continued to attempt to analyse the dancing process for my research while trying to take in the moves presented and instructions offered by the others, to improve in the class.

Thus, following the testimonies of individuals at eCdC, as well as reports by dance anthropologists and a brief attempt at my own 'participant experience' I found that learning through the moving body and indeed participating in a body based education required significant discipline. Indeed all these disciplinary enterprises seemed to

engage individuals holistically, demanding their full agency, self-awareness and awareness of others in order to make learning meaningful.

Meanwhile, it also seemed highly enjoyable, as expressed by all of my informants. Following Evans-Pritchard's quest for 'motive' and Farnell's for the 'agentive perspective', I took up Williams' suggestion. Rather than ask 'Why do people dance?' the question, 'What are people *doing* when they dance?' may better capture an individual's motive (Williams: [1991] 2004: 13). In response to this, many at eCdC associated their work - for all its disciplinary challenges – with pleasure. This experience of pleasure was a strong motivation.

Eduard explains: 'Whenever I dance I try to give all I can of myself. I believe that I have discovered that dance is what always interested me and with it I have been able to construct my life up until now. Until I can master all aspects of it. And yes, I love it too, because I feel a real pleasure in it. If not, I would be doing something else.'

Melissa says, 'With dance, it was like a love. Something that left me speechless… I love the path I'm on. I enjoy the daily classes, I enjoy having a space to think about my body and study it every day and I know very clearly that that this is what I want.'

Meanwhile Frey recalls: 'At age eleven I became interested in dance. It was like an interest that you don't feel for anything else, for football or another kind of activity. It was like love at first sight. When I dance I feel many things. It's a sensation that you can't describe, that you only feel when you are doing what you love, when you feel that you are in a place where that sensation is to be found. Above all you have to enjoy it. I enjoy it a lot.'

IV. III Intersubjective discipline: learning values at eCdC

Additionally, by interacting with others in full-bodied group exercises and choreographies, these students demonstrated a discipline in mastering not only their thinking and learning through the moving body, learning to know and trust themselves in this way but also an intersubjective discipline to interact safely and comfortably with

others with whom they are in constant direct contact. At eCdC this intersubjective discipline was shown especially in the constant direct contact their work required; such as when attempting balances or lifts. These are not possible without developing values such as trust, respect and equality. In turn, as Vivían found, engaging in direct contact is one way to master such values. Thus as well as a sense of motion, a sense of touch was also highly prioritised as a means of learning at eCdC.

I asked a nine-year-old boy, 'When you dance, is it important to trust in the others?' 'Yes,' he said. 'Because if we don't trust our partner, we can't do things well because we're afraid of falling or something.'

Again, this is important in the context of the humanistic education of the school and the insights this can afford understandings of discipline. Education after all, if it is to be applied beyond the school or studio, to society, is to include experience in interacting with people, in attempt to relate with them. And a body based education of course, in which individuals constantly interact, provides a setting in which to understand people from direct interactive experience. As Merleau-Ponty writes: 'It is through my body that I understand other people, just as it is through my body that I perceive "things".' (2002 [1945]: 216) Foucault also notes in his later work his growing interest in the 'interaction between oneself and others' (1988: 19).

Values such as those noted above could be deemed less necessary in the assignments of a regular school education prioritising rationality and objectivism; and vision as the main sense with which to approach these. They may thus be more neglected in such a system. If a sense of movement is atypical and even contrary to many educational practices, a sense of touch is similarly under-valued in western philosophy and education. Tactile practices or direct contact between students or students and staff is often uninvited in school settings. Of course the director's own experience with direct tactile interaction in school was clearly negative. Meanwhile, until the 'sensual revolution' of the 1960's touch seems, perhaps in turn, to have been under-emphasised in ethnographies.

However, touch is clearly important amongst the senses for people in many societies, as found by Geurts (2002), Hsu (2005) and Low (2007). All three note benefits of touch in these communities to include healing, with a social dimension. This is shown both in the intersubjective relationships implied in tactile practices (between physician and patient or elders and children, mothers and babies) and in the social signification of tactile gestures. Pulling a child's limbs or flexing its joints, as Geurts found in Anlo-Ewe practices in West Africa, was thought to promote good posture and coordination and in turn, elegance, agility and adaptability: all socially desirable traits also believed to help a individual navigate society (2002: 94, 97).

Likewise, treated respectfully, perhaps with a caring kind of intersubjective discipline, it seems that engaging with the sense of touch can also yield values in a body based education community like eCdC. Indeed in contrast with his earlier experience of mistreatment in tactile practice in his own schooling, director Álvaro makes clear that touch is a sense he advocates absolutely within education, as is evident at eCdC. Here is seems the benefits of respectful touch in an educational setting, could out-weigh the lack of direct contact – or the objectifying, paralysing or surveilling distance which Foucault calls the 'gaze' - in learning settings. As Vivían attests, direct contact with others can help 'show (them) the values (they) are discovering.' At eCdC, touch is a crucial part of the teaching methodology in all classes, between individuals.

The director recalls an exchange between seven of his dancers and an educational association in Yorkshire. 'The teachers were intrigued about the way our children touched each other or how we touched their children because over there it's forbidden. Over there the teachers cannot put a hand on top of a child. By law, it is forbidden. The people have another relationship with the body, with proximity, with contact. Of course in Colombia also, one lives in different ways in different areas. In the region of Paisa there's also a very different approach to the coast.. Here people are very embracing.'

Gunlodd, a nineteen year-old Icelandic girl from Reykjavik, who arrived at eCdC a year ago, took some time to adjust to this. 'When I came here everyone was always touching me, kissing me…' Today she feels more comfortable with the local tactility. 'At home

people are very closed. When you meet people you just say "Hi".'

Potter also found learning to value a sense of touch to be crucial to her shifting sensorium in her chosen field community of contemporary dancers. Thus she took up various contact improvisation exercises or close partner work with other dancers in her effort to understand how they and she in turn could learn not only to improve their dancing abilities in this setting but also be socialised into a dance community after one's prior socialisation in the non-dancing world, in a city such as London (2008: 456-7).

While a sense of kinaethesia was perhaps most highly prioritised, Potter (as well as Novack 1990) found touch to be a 'highly elaborated' and valued sense amongst contemporary dancers such as those at her London fieldsite. (2008: 457).

For professionally trained dancers she also emphasises how touch is valued not only in and of itself, but in conjunction with other senses such as a movement: 'a sense of touch operates in harmony with a sense of motion: contact of the hands leads to the sharing of weight as two dancers lean away from each other in a counterbalance, or contact with the pelvic region leads to one partner easily supporting the full weight of another in a lift.' (2008: 459).

In a more general body based education with scope for all individuals this point is important as it demonstrates how these emphasised senses of touch and motion, uncommonly valued in education, actually link, in turn linking the values each promotes: in this case, equality (the counter-balance), respect (contact with the pelvic region), and trust (the lift).

This intersubjective discipline is interesting not only in its implications that individuals be disciplined together rather than in isolation (where they may be easier controlled as such by those in power, as Foucault's cases suggest) but also because, rather than fight or compete in such a setting, with such close contact, it is in the interest of all individuals to find a way to co-operate (perhaps more so than necessary in regular classroom settings). This indicates a useful education not only for the individual but also an education which can in turn be transmitted to society; perhaps uniting the

bodies of Scheper-Hughes and Lock (1987: 8) as in this way the individual body, social body and the body politic overlap.

IV. IV Intersubjective discipline: from studio to society

'To transmit it in this way, is something very gratifying' – *Vivían Orozco*

Potter notes that after class, the dancers at her fieldsite prepare once more to enter the 'non-dancing world' (2008: 456). As they shower to cool down and change, for instance, before leaving the studio and stepping onto a bus or train where they will have to be still, they prepare to shift the sensorium once more, to conform to the sensory standards of society outside (ibid).

While the students at eCdC also made some adjustments on leaving the studio, in fact I had the opportunity to witness the transmission of sensory emphasises developed through their intersubjective discipline in their body based educational sensorium (and the values they learned from these) outside the school. The students took their ongoing lessons, including their attempts at embodiment, a shifted sensorium and the values they gained together, from the studio and back into society.

In workshops, including several I attended in Cartagena with local primary schoolchildren and one in London with secondary school teenagers, coordinators (graduate students) and current students from eCdC presented various exercises on stage, in which the attending youngsters volunteered to experience partner work in contact improvisation. These teaching exchanges and workshops showed how the disciplines mastered in a body based education such as eCdC's could be transmitted to others in society, in Colombia and beyond. All these demonstrated an intersubjective discipline with others, outside the dance or body based education community, in Potter's 'non-dancing world' (2008: 456).

In this way individuals from eCdC applied their re-education (through the body) by transmitting it to others, adults and children alike, in the dance education workshops and school exchanges noted, theatrical performances, lectures and further creative, body based social initiatives. Rather than separating their body based education from

their experience in the non-dancing world, or treating it as opposed to this, they showed efforts to integrate it with their former socialisation and education.

One director explained in an eCdC workshop with teenagers at a secondary state school in London: 'We teach through movement. We teach through dance. We dance every day. So we're using this body intelligence to teach how to become great citizens.'

In these exchanges individuals applied, demonstrated, performed, transmitted or taught the internal and interactive discipline they had built at the school expressing their mastery of engaging not only with other dancers and students in their body based educational community but also with society and the world. They brought their embodiment back into the wider contexts of education and socialisation in which they had grown up and which others were experiencing.

'*Project MA: My Body, My Home*' (see Chapter II) was one such social initiative instigated by eCdC in order to reach others, in Colombia. Many of eCdC's graduates, with dance teaching diplomas, took part in coordinating the program. Emphasising the concepts evoked by the Japanese word 'ma' of concentration, pause, silence and sacred space, starting with the inner space of the body, Project MA was the most significant social program in eCdC's focus on Education with Dance and what the school deemed the most significant pedagogical experience achieved through this strategy. Twelve hundred children were beneficiaries in the project's main years, from 2007 until 2009. In 2010, three hundred and eighty further children participated; and in 2011, two hundred and forty.

eCdC's secretary, May, explains: 'eCdC had never worked with such high number of children in one program. It was also the first time that eCdC developed a pedagogical process within the public schools that participated in the project. Seven dance studios were adapted inside some of the eighteen participant schools, thus creating special spaces for silence, concentration and creativity that had never existed before in noisy, overcrowded places where poor children are "educated" in Cartagena. Tutor teachers participated in all classes and workshops, engaging with new methodologies introduced to improve their own teaching processes and procedures. Parents and other teachers from the schools also participated in lectures and workshops based on issues that affect

the lives of vulnerable populations: violence, sexual abuse and exploitation, nutrition, ecology.'

Meanwhile, I witnessed three examples of workshops with schools. One was a weekly Saturday workshop for seven year olds, in a foundation-built school outside Cartagena. The second took place in a theatre in central Cartagena amongst children from various local primary schools. The third was a one-day event in London, for students at a secondary state school. In each of these, a number of eCdC's current students and graduates who now teach at the school, with the directors, set about demonstrating exercises in contact improvisation. These highlighted the agency of self-knowledge and self-trust as well as knowledge and trust of others; emphasising benefits of movement and touch which, as noted, are senses more often neglected or discouraged in standard western education settings.

The workshop at Skinners' Academy, a secondary state school in North London in 2012, included a lecture by Restrepo and an interactive series of exercises in which a number of Skinners students in the audience volunteered with the dancers on stage. Restrepo opened the workshop with a dialogue, to emphasise knowledge about the body. Later, through the exercises, he would encourage knowledge or learning from the body.

AR: Do you know where Colombia is?

Girl (in audience): South America?

AR: Yes, it's in South America.

AR: Do you know where Paris is?

Boy: In France!

AR: Yes, it's in France.

AR: Do you know where Jupiter is?

Boy: In space…?

AR: Yes, it is in space.

AR: Do you know where your pancreas is?

Silence.

AR: Or where your liver is? Your tibia?

Silence.

AR: So, you know where Colombia, Paris, Jupiter is… but not where your pancreas or your liver is. That is something very interesting. We know very little about our selves.

Emphasising first a knowledge about the body he prepared to show them how the body knows; an idea closer to Jackson's bodily knowledge (1983) and Csordas's knowledge from the body (1994: xii). Both knowledge about and knowledge from the body also correspond with Csordas's somatic modes of attention 'to' and 'with' bodies (2009: 138).

Álvaro explained: 'We teach through movement. We teach through dance. We dance every day.' He suggested that they could experience learning or schooling, not only as passive bodies seated in desks, as only partial agents in their physical stillness, but also as moving, acting, interacting agents; an idea explored of course by Gibson (1989 [1979]) and Ingold (2000). He then explained how this might be of use beyond the classroom or studio setting; how it might empower them in society – and in the world. 'So, we're using this body intelligence to teach how to become great citizens.' This would be shown in two interactive exercises promoting personal and social values, in which every individual volunteering to take part had to be fully present and involved with a whole-bodied, plurisensorial awareness.

The main exercises focused on themes of 'leadership' and 'respectful manipulation', aiming to teach trust (of oneself and of others), responsibility, respect and equality. As Álvaro said, introducing these: 'It's very important to follow a leader but it's also very important to be a leader.'

As noted, the leadership at eCdC and the discipline leaders imparted contrasted

sharply with notions of discipline imposed by those abusing social positions of power, such as in Foucault's disciplinary institutions or Colombia's perpetrations of violence. While demonstrating responsibility and guidance, leadership at eCdC deliberately seeks to emphasise equality. A sense of equality is demonstrated amongst individuals in constant shifts of roles: graduates are amongst the staff teaching classes at the school and senior students work with children in contact improvisation exercises in which children help them as much as they help students. At times students and staff speak openly and somewhat jokingly of a reciprocal manipulation amongst them but this refers to mutual challenges rather than harm.

I took part in the 'respectful manipulation' guided improvisation exercise and found it to be a useful follow-up experience to my dance class in Cartagena, as to how the body thinks. In the exercise at Skinners we were asked, in pairs, to assume roles. One would be 'the leader'; the other, 'the led'. I started off as 'the led' in partnership with eCdC graduate and teacher Eduard, who had invited me to join him in the auditorium stage space, from my audience seat.

In this exercise, the leader began by touching the led who was to respond as far as possible without thinking about it. The idea was to trust the body – both one's own and the other body in one's midst. At one point Eduard put a hand on my forehead and gently pushed my head back. While for a moment this felt unsafe I soon let myself fall as seconds later I felt his other hand support the base of my head. We learned to trust one another in these movements through our use of motion and touch above other senses (our eyes were closed, and there was no music or instruction until the director said 'change' just to prompt us to switch roles). We also learned to shift our sensoriums (mine particularly) from less use of touch and motion in education to highly prioritising them now.

At the start of the workshop the teenagers were rowdy. As one of the program facilitators explained, 'They'll have never seen anything like this before – no performance of any kind probably… so this is something very new for them.' Yet, by the end many were interested enough to volunteer on stage to interact bodily with the dancers in the exercises and to ask them questions.

Dance performances were another way in which individuals at eCdC transmitted their body based education. These were presented at the school, at other locations in the city, such as the local theatre in Cartagena, or outside the city: in other parts of Colombia, and beyond. Shows taken abroad were performed by eCdC's company, *Cuerpo de Indias*, although often students still at the school also joined in performances, whether with the company or in other groups for selected works.

The content of the shows, as Neveu Kringelbach (2005: 243) finds to be a common thread of contemporary dance performances, often addressed social themes to illuminate social issues or major points of transformation, such as death, love and war. I saw a 'seasonal repertoire' of shows in Cartagena and a further production at Sadler's Wells Dance House in London. All these were homages to people who had died, some violently. One work, performed in a street in Cartagena, was dedicated to a street-sweeping lady of the city, said to have been murdered by police. Meanwhile, another addressed the issue of refugees fleeing from the violence and persecution by armed groups in Colombia.

This application of what seemed to be a kind of disciplined embodiment, which individuals had willingly integrated into their own overall education was also reintegrated back into society by students who had left the school, some prior to graduating, in order to start projects of their own.

One graduate of eCdC, 33 year-old Lobadys, had consciously 're-educated' himself, partially at eCdC but also before and since. He was now studying for a Masters degree in Culture and Development while organising a social dance initiative with other students. In his understanding of power and discipline he questioned notions of ill-discipline which he found that others held of people from the Caribbean. While acknowledging persistent race and class discriminations which inflicted mistreatment on many locals, he also presented a case for these individuals not to internalise such discriminations and defended what he saw to be a different and growing reality for many Colombians, enacting their own agency.

'The people from the Caribbean were totally marginalised,' he said. 'Imagine, before they thought that people from the Caribbean were less educated and the climate was

bad for the development of civilisation, of knowledge; that we were weak and lazy, historically. There are still people who think the Caribbean is like that. That in the Caribbean nothing happens, that the Caribbean is immobile, you see? There are loads of stereotypes and under-estimations of the Caribbean.'

Perhaps recognising the value in his own body based education, and addressing what he presented as the subjugation of many from challenging circumstances in the Caribbean, such as the social injustice he felt to be perceived by people from the peripheries of Cartagena, Lobadys had gone on after graduating from eCdC to set up his own body based socio-educational initiative: a group called *Periferia* ('Periphery'). This works with young hip hop dancers, trying to find a dialogue between hip hop and contemporary dance. In turn it aims to drive a dialogue between young people from all social sectors of the city, to meet, perform and collaborate.

He showed me a social centre he was setting up with *Periferia* and friends in an old house they were renovating in Getsemaní, not far from eCdC. 'We're going to have a conference room, a library, a dance hall, a courtyard where we can eat, and a kitchen.' Outside in a garden they were making space for performances and workshops. 'The house will be called *"Ciudad Movil"* ('Mobile City'), and *Periferia* will have its meetings here.'

This is one way in which Lobadys is trying to facilitate social interaction and opportunities for young people in Cartagena, especially for those living on the city's outskirts, where he grew up, to develop projects with others in the more central parts of town.

IV. V Embodying education

Beyond transmitting these experiences of discipline from their body based education back into society many individuals at eCdC supported the directors' vision of actually implementing the school's pedagogy within the standard (not just 'arts' or 'alternative') education system of the wider society, in Colombia.

The directors had submitted a proposal to the government that eCdC be included in

the formal academic curriculum. Álvaro's hope was that this body based experience would 'become like a pilot experience that can expand to the educational system, to the welfare system and this could become a national strategy, to achieve a different kind of education… We would love the body to be fully in the centre of the educational experience. The body as a whole. In a holistic way.'

He hoped the ethic of the body which they were developing could create a revolution in education – 'a bit like *El Sistema* (the Venezuelan youth orchestra social enterprise) wanted to. Except this way doesn't require instruments – because the human body *is* an instrument!' Of course, for Mauss also, the body is an instrument and a tool. However, unlike Mauss, Álvaro stresses that it is a person's instrument, not society's.

Co-Director Marie France reiterates: 'The body is really the instrument that we have to communicate with the world. Everything happens with our body. So it is a reality in your work as a dancer, but it is also an instrument of everyday communication in the world of human communication. Dance… is very important for me in education. Not only because I practice it, but because we work with the backbone of the human being in his own routine. Dance in education seems important to me because it is something that comes directly, that isn't intellectual. It *can* be intellectual, but when we work with children or amateurs it's direct, it's an immediate sensation.. That's why I believe that dance in education is very important. Education for life. Not just for work.'

Vivían agreed. 'It's totally complementary because these values (taught at eCdC) are values which in school, they don't teach the children. At times they don't even understand - they don't know - what they're talking about. They don't understand what is valued.' Rather than propose that their body based education replace the regular pedagogy, she and Melissa suggested that its attributes, such as promoting personal and social values learned through self- and intersubjective discipline could fill gaps where this was lacking in standard education. 'I believe that the proposal of the Colegio to become part of the formal academic curriculum is very necessary', said Melissa, 'because, well, it happened to me. In school they never gave me the opportunity to educate my body in a different way. P.E. (Physical Education) was, let's say, very limited. So I think this proposal is very important. I believe that you can include it utterly

within basic education.'

This recalls Browning's finding that contemporary capoeira players in Brazil sought no longer, necessarily, to fight society by their dance but rather to integrate, include or engage with society, responding to the context of socialisation from their bodies; as agents. This was often ironic but enacted and perceived in a spirit of jest. In contrast, performances by those at eCdC, such as the dancers of *Cuerpo de Indias*, were often emotionally stirring in intent. However these also sought to address social inequalities through careful choreography and highly artistic productions. Both the examples of Browning's capoeiristas and many of the individuals at eCdC thus suggested a kind of syncretic mastery in advocating a way of educating which incorporated and built upon rather than attempted to oppose or evade their socialisation, much as contemporary dance also incorporated and built upon the education or socialisation of ballet.

As Foucault's later thinking warns against 'defining the effects of power as repression', for in so doing, 'one identifies power with a law which says no…' (1988: 1), so Browning recalls the words of inversion in the syncretic strategy of capoeira master Pastinha – 'placing the no in the yes' (1995: 108). 'This is the basic tension of the game – not a struggle *between* positive and negative forces but rather the exploration of what is negative, painful or malicious *within* the ostensibly positive, whole and benignant.' (1995: 108).

V Conclusion

'...the role of embodiment should be treated as a not insignificant area of concern and attention in teaching and learning, particularly in anthropology' - *Jonathan Skinner, (2005: vi)*

A body based education like the case of eCdC can thus inform understandings of discipline in various ways that counter Foucault's earlier presentation of individuals, violently disciplined by society (1977 [1975]) and support his later turn to agency (1988). Chiefly, against the backdrop of bodily mistreatments in Colombia, the stories of individuals in this community show how a body based education can encourage individuals to use self- and intersubjective discipline to bridge tensions (also Cartesian divides) between society and individual, mind and body.

By joining the school they build on their socialisation, including its implicit and explicit training (such as their standard education), showing an agency to recognise rather than internalise this socialisation and to pursue their own desires. At the school they seek to think with the body and to learn from the moving body – again, showing an agency to build on their earlier standard education which prioritised the disembodied intellect and subjugated the still body to the active mind (and teacher). This is especially interesting in line with Gibson and Ingold's work on the relationship between motion and knowledge.

They also take up an intersubjective discipline in shifting their sensoriums, to develop senses not typically valued in western educational settings, such as motion and touch and in turn, they develop personal and social values such as trust. They employ further intersubjective discipline in their various exchanges with others outside the studio to take their education, including these various missions of embodiment, and the senses and values they have developed together and transmit it to others in the wider society. In employing both kinds of discipline individuals at eCdC seem to be agents in their own transformation.

In all these ways, as they consciously seek to resolve the same tensions addressed by the methodology of embodiment, and demonstrate examples of doing so, they seem to

actualise the theoretical methodology of embodiment – or to embody 'embodiment' - in their living, moving examples of their experience of discipline in this setting.

In turn, as these tensions are resolved, addressed or lessened through the living attempts at 'embodiment' by individuals at the school, so too does eCdC seem to bridge any divide that might be indicated between discipline and happiness. Foucault's early studies of discipline certainly cast it a negative light and western philosophy prioritising reason over emotion perhaps again sets an ideal of discipline in pursuit of reason that is equally distant. Discipline and happiness seem, at times, to be treated in a similar manner to Cartesian dualisms, like thought and feeling, with the former elevated to the domain of reason, (and in live educational settings, often rigour and endurance) and the latter linked to recreation or reward; in a causal relationship at best.

At eCdC, by contrast, feeling and thought, or perception and conception, emotion and reason, happiness and discipline seem equally prioritised, and once more**,** integrated, in the body based educational experience. In this school they are conveyed to overlap, in subtle ways, as informants' testimonies clearly indicate a willing engagement with self-discipline and a disciplined happiness. This kind of (body based) education seems effective in its meshing of the terms, in contrast to contexts of more standard education, especially in the West– and is also notable for doing so, being western itself.

Individuals at eCdC experience a constant element of discipline, which they activate together and alone. However, this is in concert with a considerable degree of happiness, since all are at the school out of choice and find joy in what they do. Disciplining themselves according to personal motives (often including communicating their education to others in society outside) is one way to address the demanding realities of socialisation. As Foucault himself suggests, true 'governmentality' might bridge the social and individual domination of persons (1988: 19).

This is a preliminary study of some alternate understandings of discipline particularly to those presented by Foucault's major work in conjunction with education and the body, based on a single case study. Further research might take in other or additional ways in which this particular case, eCdC, informs disciplinary understandings. It might

also consider additional contexts of body based education such as Steiner Waldorf schools, military training academies, and active, interactive social rehabilitation schemes for 'young offenders' or dance education for youth deemed 'at-risk' (Hanna 1999: 110). Given Foucault's docile bodies in armies, prisons and schools and his interest in fresh interpretations of discipline, a study informed by the findings of those in such settings would add further insight.

References

Bateson, G. and Holt, C. 1972 [1944]. 'Form and Function of the Dance in Bali' in F. Boas (ed.) *The Function of Dance in Human Society*. New York: The Boas School.

Blacking, J. 1977. *The Anthropology of the Body*. London, New York and San Francisco: Academic Press.

Blackman, L. 2008. *The Body*. Oxford and New York: Berg.

Boas, F. 1941. 'Dance and Music in the Life of the Northwest Coast Indians of North America' in Boas, F. 1972 [1944]. *The Function of Dance in Human Society*. New York: The Boas School.

Bourdieu, P. 1977 [1972]. *A Theory of Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bourdieu, P. 1990 [1980]. *The Logic of Practice*. Cambridge and Malden, MA: Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P. 1990 [1982]. *In Other Words: Essays Towards a Reflexive Sociology*. Cambridge: Polity Press

Browning, B. 1995. *Resistance in Motion*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Buckland, T. J. (ed.) 1999. *Dance in the Field: Theory, Methods and Issues in Dance Ethnography*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Chakravorty, P. 2004. 'Dance, Pleasure and Indian Women as Multisensorial Subjects' in *Visual Anthropology* 17:1-17: Routledge.

Castro, D. 1998. 'Carlos Gardel and The Argentine Tango: The Lyric of Social Irresponsibility and Male Inadequacy' in W. Washabaugh (ed.) *The Passion of Music and Dance: Body, Gender and Sexuality*. Oxford and New York: Berg.

Craster, K. 1871. 'The Centipede and The Toad' in *Pinnafore Poems*.

Csordas, T. J. 1990 [1988]. 'Embodiment as a Paradigm for Anthropology' in *Ethos*, Vol. 18, No. 1.

Csordas, T. J. 1993. 'Somatic Modes of Attention' in *Cultural Anthropology*, Vol. 8, No. 2. : Blackwells Publishing.

Csordas, T. J. (ed.) 1994. *Embodiment and Experience: The existential ground of culture and self*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Daniel, Y. 1995. *Dance and Social Change in Contemporary Cuba*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Descartes, R. 1637. *Discourse on Method*.

Descartes, R. 1637. *Optics*.

Descartes, R. 1644. *Principles of Philosophy*.

Descartes, R. 1988. *Descartes: Selected Philosophical Writings*, trans. J. Cottingham, R. Stoothof and D. Murdoch. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Douglas, M. 1970. *Natural Symbols: Explorations in Cosmology*. London: Barrie and Rockliff The Cresset Press.

Evans-Pritchard, E.E. 1928. 'The Dance' in *Africa: Journal of the International African Institute*, Vol. 1, No. 4.

Farnell, B. 1994. 'Ethno-graphics and the Moving Body' in *Man*, Vol. 1 – New Series Vol. 29.

Farnell, B. 1999. 'Moving Bodies, Acting Selves' in *Annual Review of Anthropology*, Vol. 28: Annual Reviews.

Farnell, B. 1999. 'It Goes Without Saying – But Not Always' in Buckland, T. J. (ed.) *Dance in the Field: Theories, Methods and Issues in Dance Ethnography*.

Foucault, M. 1991. 'Governmentality' in Burchell G., C. Gordon and P. Miller (eds.) *The Foucault Effect: Studies in Governmentality*. London: Harvester Wheatsheaf.

Foucault, M. 1977 [1975]. *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. London: Penguin Books.

Friedson, S. M. 1966. *Dancing Prophets: Musical Experience in Tumbuka Healing*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press.

Gibson, J. J. 1966. *The Senses Considered as Perceptual Systems*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Gibson, J. J. 1986 [1979]. *The Ecological Approach to Visual Perception*. Hillsdale, New Jersey and London: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates (Inc).

Geurts, K. 2002. *Culture and the Senses: Bodily Ways of Knowing in an African Community*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Gordan, C. (eds.) 1980. *Michel Foucault: Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977 by Michel Foucault*. London: The Harvester Press Limited.

Grau, A. and Jordan, S. (eds.) 2000. *Europe Dancing: Perspectives on Theatre Dance and Cultural Identity*. London: Routledge

Hanna, J. L. 2006. *Dancing for Health: Conquering and Preventing Stress*. Lanham, New York, Toronto and Oxford: Altamira Press.

Hanna, J. L. 1999. *Partnering Dance and Education: Intelligent Moves for Changing Times*. Auckland: Human Kinetics.

Holst-Warhaft, G. 1998 'Rebetika: The Double-descended Deep Songs of Greece' in W. Washabaugh (ed.) *The Passion of Music and Dance: Body, Gender and Sexuality*. Oxford and New York: Berg.

Howes, D. (eds.) 2006 [2005]. *Empire of the Senses: The Sensual Culture Reader*. Oxford and New York: Berg.

Hughes-Freeland, F. 2011 [2008]. *Embodied Communities: Dance Traditions and Change in Java*. New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Hsu, E. 1999. *The Transmission of Chinese Medicine*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hsu, E. 2005. 'Tactility and the Body in Early Chinese Medicine' in *Science in Context* 18 (1): 7-34

Ingold, T. 2000. *The Perception of the Environment: Essays on livelihood, dwelling and skill*. London and New York: Routledge.

Jackson, M. 1983. 'Knowledge of the Body' in *Man*, New Series, Vol. 18, No. 2.

Low, C. 2007. 'Finding and Foregrounding Massage in Khoisan Ethnography' in *Journal of Southern African Studies* 33 (4): 783-99.

Martin, L. H. , Gutman, H. and Hutton, P. H. (eds.) 1988. *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*. Amherst: The University of Massachausetts Press.

Mauss, M. 1973 [1934]. 'Techniques of the Body' in *Economy and Society*, 2: 1, 70-88.

Mead, M. 1954 [1943]. *Coming of Age in Samoa*. Melbourne, London and Baltimore: Penguin Books.

Merleau-Ponty, M. 2002 [1945]. *Phenomenology of Perception*. London and New York: Routledge Classics.

Ness, S. A. 1992. *Body, Movement, and Culture: Kinesthetic and Visual Symbolism in a Philippine Community.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Neveu Kringelbach, H. 2005 'Encircling the Dance: Social Mobility through the Transformation of Performance in Urban Senegal'. Unpublished DPhil thesis (published monograph in progress). University of Oxford, UK.

Neveu Kringelbach, H. 2007. 'Cool Play: emotionality in dance as a resource in Senegalese urban women's associations' in H. Wulff (ed.) *The Emotions: A Cultural Reader.* Oxford: Berg.

Novack, C. J. 1990. *Sharing the Dance: Contact Improvisation and American Culture.* Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press.

Novack, C. J. 1997. 'Sense, Meaning, and Perception in Three Dance Cultures' in J. C. Desmond (ed.) *Meaning in Motion: New Cultural Studies of Dance.* Durham, North Carolina, USA: Duke University Press.

Ortner. S. 1984. 'Theory in Anthropology Since the Sixties' in *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Vol. 26, No. 1.

Potter, C. 2008. 'Sense of Motion, Senses of Self: Becoming a Dancer', in *Ethnos,* Vol. 73:4.

Radcliffe-Brown, A.R. 1964. *The Andaman Islanders*. New York: The Free Press of Glencoe.

Reay, D. 2004. 'It's all becoming a habitus': beyond the habitual use of habitus in educational research' in *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol. 25, No. 4: 431-444.

Restrepo Hernández, A. December 2007 – January – February 2008 'Llora et Labora (Memoria de la Carne)' in *Numero (Cincuenta y Cinco)*, Separata I-XXIV.

Rowe, N. 2008. 'Dance education in the Occupied Palestinian Territories: hegemony, counter-hegemony and anti-hegemony' in *Research in Dance Education*, Vol. 9, Issue. 1.

Royce, A. P. 1977. *The Anthropology of Dance*. Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press.

Savigliano, M. E. 1998. 'From Wallflowers to Femmes Fatales: Tango and the Performance of Passionate Femininity' in W. Washabaugh (ed.) *The Passion of Music and Dance: Body, Gender and Sexuality*. Oxford and New York: Berg.

Scheper-Hughes, N. and Lock, M. 1987. 'The Mindful Body: A Prolegomenon to Future Work in Medical Anthropology' in *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, New Series, Vol. 1, No. 1.

Seeger, A. 2004. *Why Suya Sing: A Musical Anthropology of an Amazonian People.* Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Skinner, J. 2005. 'Embodiment and Teaching and Learning in Anthropology' in *Anthropology in Action*, 12(2):v-ix.

Sklar, D. 2000. 'Reprise: On Dance Ethnography' in *Dance Research Journal*, 32 (1):70-7.

Sklar, D. 2001. *Dancing with the Virgin: Body and Faith in the Fiesta of Tortugas, New Mexico.* California: University of California Press.

Sloat, S. 2010. *Making Caribbean Dance: Continuity and Creativity in Island Cultures*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.

Spencer, P. 1985. *Society and the Dance.* Cambridge, London, New York, New Rochelle, Melbourne and Sydney: Cambridge University Press.

Stoller, P. 1989. *The Taste of Ethnographic Things: The Senses in Anthropology.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Strathern, A. J. 1996. *Body Thoughts.* Michigan: University of Michigan Press.

Strathern and Stewart. 2011. 'Personhood: Embodiment and Personhood' in Mascia-Lees, F. E. (ed.) A Companion to the Anthropology of the Body and Embodiment. Oxford: Blackwell.

Thomas, H. 2003. *The Body, Dance and Cultural Theory.* Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Turner, B. S. 2008. *The Body and Society: Explorations in Social Theory.* London: Sage.

Turner, T. 1994. 'Bodies and anti-bodies: flesh and fetish in contemporary social theory' in T. J. Csordas (ed.) *Embodiment and Experience: The essential ground of culture and self.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Varela, C. 1992. 'Cartesianism revisited: the ghost in the moving machine or in the lived body' in JAHSM 7, 5-64.

Wade, P. 2000. *Music, Race, and Nation: Musica Tropical in Colombia.* Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press.

Washabaugh, W. (eds.) 1998. *The Passion of Music and Dance: Body, Gender and Sexuality.* Oxford and New York: Berg.

Williams, D. 2004 [1991]. *Anthropology and the Dance.* Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.

Wulff, H. 2009 [2007]. *Dancing at the Crossroads: Memory and Mobility in Ireland.* New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books.

Reports

El Tiempo. 30. 04. 2012. 'Llegan mas de 200 mil extranjeros en cruceros a Cartagena'. (www.eltiempo.com).

UNHCR (The UN Refugee Agency). 2012. UNHCR country operations profile – Colombia. (www.unhcr.org).

Lectures

TedxObserver. March 2012. 'Álvaro Restrepo – Stories and Dance from Colombian Barrios': www.youtube.com/watch?v=_dOrjB3tN0g.

Films

Mead, M. and Bateson, G. 1952. *Trance Dance in Bali.*